60

PREPAREDNESS FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS (SDGs)

[Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their 32nd Report (17th Lok Sabha)]

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2022-23)

SIXTIETH REPORT

SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA

सत्यमेव जयते

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

PAC NO. 2288

SIXTIETH REPORT

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2022-23)

(SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)

PREPAREDNESS FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS (SDGs)

[Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their 32nd Report (17th Lok Sabha)]

सत्यमेव जयते

Presented to Lok Sabha on: 14.12.2022

Laid in Rajya Sabha on: 14.12.2022

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

December, 2022 /Agrahayana, 1944 (Saka)

CONTENTS

		PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2022-23)		(iii)
INTRODUCTION	.....	(iv)
CHAPTER I	Report	1
CHAPTER II	Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government	
CHAPTER III	Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government	
CHAPTER IV	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration	
CHAPTER V	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies	

APPENDICES

I *Minutes of the 12th sitting of the Public Accounts Committee (2022-23) held on 5th December, 2022.

II Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their Thirty-second Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha)

**Not appended to the cyclostyled copy of the Report*

COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2022-23)

Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury - Chairperson

MEMBERS

LOK SABHA

2. Shri Subhash Chandra Baheria
3. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
4. Shri Jagdambika Pal
5. Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
6. Shri Pratap Chandra Sarangi
7. Shri Rahul Ramesh Shewale
8. Shri Gowdar Mallikarjunappa Siddeshwara
9. Shri Brijendra Singh
10. Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh alias Lalan Singh
11. Dr. Satya Pal Singh
12. Shri Jayant Sinha
13. Shri Balashowry Vallabbhaneni
14. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav
15. Shri Shyam Singh Yadav

RAJYA SABHA

16. Shri Shaktisinh Gohil
17. Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita
18. Dr. Amar Patnaik
19. Dr. C. M. Ramesh
20. Vacant*
21. Dr. M Thambidurai
22. Dr. Sudhanshu Trivedi

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri T. G. Chandrasekhar - Additional Secretary
2. Shri Tirthankar Das - Director
3. Smt. Anju Kukreja - Deputy Secretary

---

* Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy ceased to be a Member of Committee consequent upon his retirement from Rajya Sabha on 21 June, 2022.

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson, Public Accounts Committee (2022-23), having been authorised by the Committee, do present this Sixtieth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their Thirty-second Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on **"Preparedness for the Implementation of Sustainable Development Goals"** relating to NITI Aayog.

2. The Thirty-second Report was presented to Lok Sabha/laid in Rajya Sabha on 15th March, 2021. Replies of the Government to the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Report were received. The Committee considered and adopted the Sixtieth Report at their Sitting held on 05 December, 2022. Minutes of the Sitting of the Committee are given at Appendix I.

3. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in **bold** in the body of the Report.

4. The Committee place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the Committee Secretariat and the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

5. An analysis of the action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Thirty-second Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) is given at *Appendix-II*.

NEW DELHI;
07 December, 2022
16 Agrahayana, 1944 (*Saka*)

ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY
Chairperson,
Public Accounts Committee

CHAPTER - I

REPORT

This Report of the Public Accounts Committee deals with the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee (17th Lok Sabha) on "Preparedness for the implementation of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)".

2. The Thirty-Second Report (17th Lok Sabha) which was presented to Lok Sabha/ laid in Rajya Sabha on 15th March, 2021 contained 20 Observations/Recommendations. The Action Taken Notes in respect of all the Observations/Recommendations have been received from the NITI Aayog and these are broadly categorized as follows:

i. Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government:

Para Nos. 1 to 20

Total: 20
Chapter – II

ii. Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government:

NIL

Total: NIL
Chapter – III

iii. Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration:

NIL

Total: NIL
Chapter – IV

iv. Observations/Recommendations in respect of which Government have furnished interim replies/no replies:

NIL

Total: NIL
Chapter -V

3. The 32nd Report of PAC (17th Lok Sabha) was based on the Audit Review of the preparedness of the Government for the implementation of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), Audit had observed several deficiencies in the preparedness for

Implementation of SDGs *viz.* non-initiation of measures towards preparation of a roadmap with defined milestones aligned with SDG targets to be achieved, non-conducting of meetings of the Multi-disciplinary Task Force at regular intervals, delay in finalisation of 15 year Vision Document, mapping exercise undertaken in the selected States was not comprehensive, focused or sustained, no centralized Public awareness campaign was envisaged, strategy document did not project the financing and budgeting requirements, delay in approval of NIF held up finalization of monitoring and reporting framework on implementation of SDGs, there was no proposal to identify milestones for the national indicators, specific and sustained measures for promoting awareness and stakeholders involvement with Goal 3 were not seen in the States, Policy Coherence initiatives undertaken were either absent or inadequate in states, need for augmentation of Public health expenditure and non-availability of regular/uniform data for certain health indicators etc. The Committee had accordingly given the Observations/ Recommendations in their Thirty - Second Report (17th Lok Sabha). Gist of important Observations/Recommendations as contained in this Report is given as under:

a) The Committee, while expecting a suitable explanation in this regard impressed upon NITI Aayog on the need for arranging meetings at quarterly intervals so that the suggestions/feedback may become available more frequently, and consequently boost the monitoring process.

b) The Committee desired that NITI Aayog pursue the matter with the defaulting States for expeditious completion of the required documents and put in place an effective co-ordinating/monitoring mechanism in order to fast track the achievement of the SDGs and related targets.

c) The Committee were of opinion that there is a need to share the commitments for the future with the younger generation. The Committee would, therefore, expect to be apprised of the measures taken in this direction.

d) The Committee desired that NITI Aayog should have an Interactive web page to reach out to the States and the general public.

e) The Committee desired that NITI Aayog should frame detailed guidelines for the Private Sector to enable the sector to channel their resources and activities towards achievement of SDGs. Businesses need to be invited to apply their creativity and

innovation towards solving sustainable development challenges and engaged as partners in the development process. The Committee further desired that NGOs and similar organisations involved in charity work are apprised of SDGs through various means and they may be encouraged to participate in the awareness programme on SDGs.

f) The Committee recommended that MoSPI should initiate effective steps expeditiously so as to identify the milestones for all the indicators and commence working on these indicators in right earnest.

g) The Committee desired that besides the meetings of Ministries concerned and the Task Force, Members of Parliament, MLAs, Chairman, Zila Panchayat, District Health officer, Officers at the Block level etc. may also be associated with the task of raising awareness and thereby enabling effective participation in achievement of SDGs.

h) The Committee recommended that the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare should develop an effective mechanism for monitoring the various programmes/schemes at the Block, District and State level so as to achieve the target of mapping by all the States.

i) The Committee desired that with a view to improving health services in remote areas, at least one Allopathic doctor along with paramedical staff should be posted in each Wellness Centre. The Committee felt that there was also an imperative need to constantly monitor the functioning of Wellness Centres at regular intervals besides ensuring regular attendance of Doctors so that the goal of providing affordable, effective and reliable health care, especially for the poor in the rural areas is achieved.

4. The Committee will now deal with the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations made in the original Report which either need reiteration or merit Comments.

I. <u>Efforts towards mainstreaming activities pertaining to SDGs (Recommendation Para No. 2)</u>

5. The Committee noted that NITI Aayog had undertaken several multi-disciplinary stakeholder consultations and conducted periodic reviews with States and UTs for mainstreaming activities like preparation of vision/strategy documents; creation of nodal structures; mapping of targets; capacity building for implementing, monitoring and

evaluation; formulation of state-specific indicators and orienting budgets with SDGs. However, preparation of a roadmap with defined milestones aligned with SDG targets to be achieved was not initiated till the time of presentation of the Audit Report. The Committee, in this regard, noted that milestones for the SDGs have been a part of the 2030 Agenda. For achieving these milestones, comprehensive and co-ordinated efforts of all stakeholders is a necessity. The Committee were surprised to note that the nodal institution, NITI Aayog pursued the matter with the States for developing the roadmaps only after the issue was pointed out by Audit. The Committee, in this regard, expressed the view that the apparently inappropriate attitude displayed at the initial stage towards a commitment made by India in the United Nations may have a bearing on the good standing the country has in the pursuit of SDGs. The Committee, therefore, exhorted NITI Aayog to take suitable measures to compensate for the delayed action. NITI Aayog's role in implementation of SDGs in the Allocation of Business should be clearly specified. The Committee also desired to have details of the current status of development of roadmaps by all the States/UTs and remedial measures taken against the defaulting States/UTs.

6. The NITI Aayog in their Action Taken Notes have stated as under:

> "A roadmap usually includes objectives, milestones, deliverables and planned timeline. NITI Aayog has been working with the States and UTs right from the year 2016 to help develop these key elements of the SDG roadmap. As has also been maintained before, objectives and milestones are clearly enunciated in the SDGs and associated targets as endorsed by India along with other countries. Vision Documents of States and UTs reconfirm the SDGs, indicate strategies to achieve them and also inform about programmes and initiatives being implemented in that direction. The SDG mapping of schemes/programmes and departments also reorient them in the direction of SDG implementation. The monitoring of schemes and programmes is further focused by the adoption of State SDG Indicator Frameworks, which are prepared in consistency with the National Indicator Framework and also by addressing the contextual specificities of respective States. Monitoring conducted along the indicators help in focusing on deliverables (programme outputs) in keeping with the timeline. As of now, most States (except Goa, Kerala, Meghalaya, Odisha, Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu, Telangana, and West Bengal) and some UTs (except Chandigarh, Jammu and Kashmir, Ladakh, Lakshadweep, and Dadra and Nagar Haveli and Daman and Diu) have Vision Documents. Similarly, most States (except Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Maharashtra, Punjab and Telangana, where it is under preparation) and some UTs (Andaman and Nicobar Islands and Delhi) have already prepared State Indicator Framework. NITI Aayog is continuously following up with the States and UTs for preparation and use of State Indicator Framework for monitoring.

The SDG India Index computed annually since 2018 has played a very effective role in goading States and UTs in their efforts towards implementation and achievement of SDGs. It brings out the status of States and UTs in terms of SDG achievement based on latest available data and ranks their performance. India is internationally acknowledged as a pioneering country to have developed, adopted and regularly used such a tool in monitoring SDG achievement at national and sub-national levels."

7. During the course of vetting of the aforesaid replies of NITI aayog, Audit stated as under:

"NITI Aayog had not responded to the PAC's recommendation regarding clearly specifying its role in implementation of SDGs in the Allocation of Business.

Preparation of Vision Document and State Indicator Framework is yet to be completed by all the States/UTs. As desired by PAC, measures taken against the defaulting States/UTs may be elucidated."

8. In reply to the aforesaid Audit observation, NITI Aayog submitted as under:

"It is not for NITI Aayog to modify the Allocation of Business Rules.

With regard to ensuring that States/UTs prepare Vision Document and State Indicator Framework, measures taken by NITI Aayog fall into three categories. NITI Aayog takes up the matter in meetings with the States/UTs concerned. Second, it brings up the issues in common reviews with States and presses for action. Third, the SDG India Index Report records the performance of States and UTs in the context of comparison and ranking, which has substantial influencing and persuasive power."

9. **In their Original Report the Committee had observed that work on preparing a roadmap with defined milestones aligned with SDG targets to be achieved was not initiated till the time of presentation of Audit Report. While exhorting NITI Aayog to take suitable measures to compensate for the delayed action, the Committee desired to be apprised of the current status of formulation of roadmaps by all the States/UTs and remedial measures taken against the defaulting States/UTs. In this regard, NITI Aayog in their ATN informed the Committee that as of now, most States (except Goa, Kerala Meghalaya, Odisha, Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu, Telangana and West Bengal) and some UTs (except Chandigarh, Jammu and Kashmir, Ladakh, Lakshadweep and Dadra and Nagar Haveli and Daman and Diu) have prepared vision documents. Similarly, most**

States (except Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Maharashtra, Punjab and Telengana, where it is under preparation) and some UTs (Andaman and Nicobar Islands and Delhi) have already prepared State Indicator Framework. From the information furnished, it is evident that a number of States and UTs neither have the Vision Document ready nor developed the State Indicator Framework. Moreover, as for the Action Taken towards formulation of roadmaps by all the States/UTs, NITI Aayog have merely stated that they are continuously following up with the States and UTs the matter of preparing the State Indicator Framework for monitoring. Considering the facts of the matter, the Committee feel constrained to observe that no sincere efforts have been made by the NITI Aayog to ensure that the States/UTs prepare their Vision Document and State Indicator Framework. The Committee are also perturbed to note that no concrete measures have been taken by the NITI Aayog to ensure that the State Governments prepare the documents. The Committee cannot accept the flippant attitude towards this pertinent issue after it was highlighted by Audit in their Audit Report and the recommendation of the Committee as made in their 32nd Report (17th Lok Sabha). Though, several steps are stated to have been taken by the NITI Aayog to ensure that States/UTs prepare their roadmap with defined milestones, the status still remains the same. While reiterating their recommendation made in this regard, the Committee emphasize upon NITI Aayog to take some stringent measures against those States/UTs who, are yet to prepare the roadmaps. Responsibility of the concerned officials may also be fixed for the delay in preparation of the Vision Document and State Indicator Framework. The Committee would like to be apprised of the details of the action taken in this regard as well as the current status of development of roadmaps by all the States/UTs and remedial action taken against the defaulting States /UTs.

II. Meetings of the Multi-Disciplinary Task Force (Recommendation Para No. 3)

10. The Committee found that apart from directly reviewing the work on SDGs in the State and Central Ministries, NITI Aayog had constituted in August 2017 a multi-disciplinary Task Force to analyse and review implementation of SDGs. Though the

Task Force was required to meet at least once in each quarter, the Committee found that only two meetings were held since its constitution. The Committee, while expecting a suitable explanation in this regard impressed upon NITI Aayog on the need for arranging meetings at quarterly intervals so that the suggestions/feedback may become available more frequently, and consequently boost the monitoring process.

11. In their Action Taken Note, NITI Aayog submitted as follows:

"The membership of the SDG Task Force comprised four representatives from NITI Aayog, one each from the Ministry of External Affairs and the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, one from the National Institute of Public Finance and Policy (NIPFP), one from the Research and Development System for Developing Countries (RIS) as well as one representative each from three State Governments and one Central Ministry on an annual rotation basis. Experience showed that the participation of Central Ministries and State Governments was limited and restrictive and likely to generate a sense of exclusion in other States/UTs not part of the Task Force on a regular basis. Participation of experts also needed to be more broad-based. Therefore, after the 2020 VNR preparatory meeting, no other meeting of the said Task Force has been undertaken, primarily due to the challenges imposed by the pandemic. While a more widely sourced technical consultative group is being formed, regular consultations with States and UTs have continued."

12. In their vetting comments to aforesaid Action Taken Note, Audit stated as under:

"PAC may take a suitable view of Ministry's reply that no other meeting of the Task Force has been undertaken after the 2020 VNR preparatory meeting. Further, composition of technical consultative group being formed along with outcomes of meetings of the said group may be furnished to PAC."

13. In response to the aforesaid Audit Comments, NITI Aayog submitted as follows:

"With a view to accessing broader consultative and technical support, the SDG Task Force has been reconstituted on 20.09.2021 with Vice Chairman, NITI Aayog as the Chair. The membership of the Task Force has now been expanded to include eight Central Ministries/Departments and all States/UTs on a regular basis. This improves the strategic compass of the Task Force and the expertise at its disposal. The next meeting will be scheduled in the 2nd half of October 2021."

14. **While observing that only two meetings were held since the constitution of multi-disciplinary Task Force in August 2017, to analyse and review the implementation of SDGs, the Committee in their 32nd Report had impressed upon NITI Aayog on the need for arranging such meetings at quarterly intervals in**

order to get their suggestions/feedback more frequently. In their Action Taken Notes, NITI Aayog have informed inter-alia that the participation of Central Ministries and State Governments was limited and restrictive and participation of experts also needed to be more broad-based. This amply reveals that the Apex policy-making body, NITI Aayog, while constituting the Task Force could not foresee these bottlenecks and resorted to an adhoc approach. The Committee feel that analyzing and reviewing the implementation of SDGs is a very important task and NITI Aayog should have adopted a more professional approach by taking into consideration all concomitant facts while constituting the Task Force so that the bottlenecks which were faced could have been avoided. The Committee have also been informed that no meeting of the Task Force was held after 2020 VNR preparatory meeting primarily due to challenges imposed by the Pandemic. However, it has now been informed that with a view to accessing broader consultative and technical support, the SDG Task Force was re-constituted on 20-09-2021 with the meetings scheduled. The Action Taken Note submitted by NITI Aayog is however, silent on the reasons for not conducting such sittings regularly and efforts made in this direction. Only the pandemic situation is cited as being the contributing factor in this regard, which is not acceptable and NITI Aayog should have explored the possibility of conducting such meetings virtually during the pandemic. The Action Taken Note also does not specify the steps initiated by NITI Aayog to persuade the Central Ministries/State Governments for joining the Task Force. This is indicative of a non-serious approach displayed by NITI Aayog on this aspect. The Committee would like to know the position of participation of Central Ministries and State Governments in the re-constituted SDG Task Force. The Committee may also be apprised of the reasons that prompted NITI Aayog to re-constitute the SDG Task Force, when the earlier Task Force had not done anything tangible. The Committee would, therefore, desire NITI Aayog take all necessary measures with the view to ensuring that the meetings of the re-constituted Task Force are held at regular intervals. The Committee feel that holding meetings of the re-constituted Task Force regularly as per requirement will not only strengthen the existing mechanism for analyzing and reviewing implementation of SDGs, but

also enable NITI Aayog to keep a constant watch over the progress in achieving the Sustainable Development Goals. The Committee would also like to be informed of the meetings of the re-constituted Task Force held so far and the outcome thereof.

III. Preparation of "15 Year Vision Document" (Recommendation Para No. 5)

15. The Committee were concerned to note that the "15 Year Vision Document" which is to serve as the basis for the strategy and Action Agenda document is yet to be released although five years have passed. The Committee were appreciative of the intention of NITI Aayog to make the vision Document broad-based and integrally focused on States expectations and priorities owing to which importance has been given to obtain inputs from the Ministries and the States. While noting that NITI Aayog is in the process of reviewing and finalizing the draft document and has assigned the work to a multi-disciplinary team, the Committee found it to be intriguing in this regard is that it was only after the Audit pointed out this issue, that NITI Aayog took the initiative of assigning the work to a multi-disciplinary team. The Committee had desired to be apprised of the conclusive details in regard to the date on which the multi-disciplinary team was constituted and by when the vision Document would be finalised. The Committee desired to be apprised of the conclusive details in this regard.

16. In their Action Taken Note, NITI Aayog stated as under:

> "The work on the preparation of the Vision Document has been underway for the last two years. However, preparation has been delayed due to the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic. The impact of the pandemic has necessitated re-working of the growth models, assumptions and requires new sets of data to project key economic indicators for the next 15 years incorporating the post-COVID reality. Taking this into account, the exercise of making fresh projections has commenced and preparation of the Vision Document is expected to be completed by March 2022."

17. **The Committee were constrained to observe that the "15 Year Vision document", which was to serve as the basis for the strategy and Action Agenda document was not released till the presentation of 32nd Report (17th Lok Sabha) of Public Accounts Committee to Parliament. Apprising the Committee about the present position of preparation of the Vision Document, the NITI Aayog in their**

ATN has stated that since the impact of the Pandemic has necessitated re-working of the growth models and requires new set of data to project key economic indicators for the next 15 years, the preparation of this document is expected to be completed by early 2022. The Committee would desire to be apprised of the present position in regard to formulating and implementing the Vision Document.

IV. Preparation for achieving the SDGs Goals (Recommendation Para No. 6)

18. So far as the preparation for achieving the goals at the State level is concerned, the Committee felt perturbed to note that the work on Vision/Strategy/Action Agenda documents in Uttar Pradesh and West Bengal were at preparatory stage. Kerala had prepared a Perspective plan, 2030 in the year 2014 but the Plan has not been reviewed and realigned with SDGs. Chhattisgarh had published its Vision 2030 document in March 2019. The Committee also regretted to observe that the mapping exercise undertaken in the selected States was not comprehensive. For instance, certain Schemes/Goals/Targets have reportedly not been mapped at all in Assam, Chhattisgarh, Haryana, Maharashtra and Uttar Pradesh. The Committee were constrained to observe that NITI Aayog had not explained the reasons for slow progress at the State level and the obstacles the States may have been facing in adopting/implementing the SDGs. The Committee desired that the monitoring agency, NITI Aayog needs to identify and recognize the difficulties faced by different States, assist in addressing them and apprise the Committee of the same. The Committee also desired NITI Aayog to pursue the matter with the defaulting States for expeditious completion of the required documents and put in place an effective co-ordinating/monitoring mechanism in order to fast track the achievement of the SDGs and related targets.

19. In the Action Taken Note on the aforesaid recommendations, the Committee submitted as under:

> "NITI Aayog continues to follow up with the States with respect to localisation of SDGs. States excepting those of Goa, Kerala, Meghalaya, Odisha, Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu, Telangana and West Bengal have completed/adopted their Vision

2030. All the States have also completed their mapping documents and reviewed their mapping of schemes with a view to making them comprehensive.

In the context of SDG localisation, States have increasingly laid emphasis on monitoring of SDG implementation and assessment of progress. All the States, except the State of Punjab, have State Indicator Frameworks (SIF) in place. The SIFs are extremely useful in monitoring of various schemes and tracking of outputs/outcomes thereof as relevant to corresponding SDG targets. States have put in place high level institutional mechanisms under the leadership of senior officials to review progress on a regular basis. In course of the last one year, NITI Aayog has extensively visited the States (Assam, Meghalaya, Odisha, Gujarat, Karnataka, Kerala, Himachal Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, Jharkhand, Arunachal Pradesh, Uttar Pradesh, Uttarakhand, Andhra Pradesh, Sikkim among others) to orient key government officials on general issues of SDGs, the SDG India Index, Indicator Frameworks and tracking of progress.

NITI Aayog is also working with laggard States on the matters of concern. For instance, after the release of the SDG India Index 2020-21 on 3rd June 2021, the NITI Aayog team is visiting the States to discuss progress on SDG implementation, highlight issues and concerns and explore remedial measures at the highest level – in many cases involving the Chief Ministers. So far, the States of Assam, Meghalaya, Odisha, Gujarat, Karnataka, Kerala, Himachal Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, Jharkhand, Arunachal Pradesh, Uttar Pradesh, Uttarakhand, Andhra Pradesh, Sikkim and Nagaland have already been visited."

20. In their Vetting Comments Audit observed as follows:

"Reply is silent on putting in place an effective coordinating/monitoring mechanism in order to fast track the achievement of the SDGs and related targets."

21. In response to abovesaid Audit observation, NITI Aayog stated as under:

"NITI Aayog's role and function in coordination and monitoring of SDG implementation has been described. Further, the reconstituted SDG Task Force will play an important role in strengthening the monitoring and coordination process."

22. **In their Original Report, while noticing that NITI Aayog has advised the States to do their own mapping in consonance with the manner it is done at the Central level, the Committee desired NITI Aayog to pursue the matter with the defaulting States for expeditiously completing the required documents and establishing an effective co-ordinating / monitoring mechanism in order to fast track the achievement of the SDGs and related targets. In their ATN, NITI Aayog have stated that States, except Goa, Kerala, Meghalaya, Odisha, Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu, Telangana and West Bengal have completed/adopted their Vision 2030. All**

the States have also completed their mapping documents and reviewed mapping of schemes with a view to making them comprehensive. However, NITI Aayog have not furnished the information regarding putting in place an effective coordinating/ monitoring mechanism so as to ensure expeditiously achieving the SDGs and related targets. The Committee wonder how in the absence of effective monitoring mechanism NITI Aayog can review the achievement of targets by the States and also reviewed the action initiated/taken against the defaulting States. While reiterating their earlier recommendation, the Committee urge the NITI Aayog to vigorously pursue the matter with the remaining States and desire to be apprised of the remedial/corrective action taken in this regard. They would also like to be informed of the complete/updated details of the preparation of Vision/Strategy/Action Agenda Documents and mapping of Schemes/Goals / Targets by all the States/UTs within a period of three months of the presentation of this Report to Parliament.

V. Mobilisation of Resources for Implementation of SDG Agenda (Recommendation No. 10)

23. The Committee observed that no comprehensive exercise for assessing and identifying the financial resources required for implementing SDGs has been undertaken either by the Ministry of Finance at the Centre or by the selected States. No steps have been initiated at the Central level for integrating SDGs in national budgeting and most of the selected States were only at the preliminary stage of orienting their budget with SDGs even after 5 years following the General Assembly Resolution. The Committee found that NITI Aayog has not been able to apprise the Committee of the steps taken towards integration of SDG related financial resources in national budgeting. It was only after the Committee took up the subject for examination, that NITI Aayog took the initiative of conducting a study by the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs) jointly with the International Monetary Fund (IMF) for estimating the financial resources needed to achieve the SDGs in the areas of education, health, electricity, roads and water and sanitation. The study Report was currently stated to be under finalization. The Committee desired to be apprised of the outcome of the study and follow up action taken thereon by the NITI Aayog and Ministry of Finance

(Department of Economic Affairs). The Committee were of the view in this regard even in the likelihood of harmonizing the SDGs with the Central Sector Schemes, the benefit towards achieving SDGs should be clearly delineated so that India can showcase the country's achievement.

24. In their Action Taken Note, NITI Aayog stated as under:

> "The study conducted by Ministry of Finance (D/o Economic Affairs) jointly with International Monetary Fund (IMF) for estimating the financial resources needed to achieve SDGs in the areas of education, health, electricity, roads and water and sanitation is under finalisation."

25. In their vetting comments Audit observed that the probable date of finalization of study report may be intimated to PAC.

26. **The Committee are perturbed to note that the study by the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs) for estimating the financial resources needed to achieve the SDGs in the areas of education, health, electricity roads and water and sanitation is yet to be finalised. The Committee are concerned to note that the NITI Aayog have merely furnished the same reply which was placed before them prior to presentation of original Report on the subject. The very fact that the Study is yet to be finalised, despite the lapse of two years, confirms the conviction of the Committee that no sincere efforts have been made by NITI Aayog as well as the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs) to complete the same at the earliest. The Committee would like to know the reasons for delay in finalisation of such Study Report and the precise date by which it would be completed. The Committee would like NITI Aayog to convey the Committee's concern over the delay in finalization of the study to the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs) and request them to expedite the same. The Committee would like to be informed of the status of the study within a period of two months.**

VI. National Indicator Framework (NIF) Recommendation Para No. 11

27. The Committee noted that for enabling monitoring and review, the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation (MoSPI) has been entrusted with the task of

developing a National Indicator Framework (NIF) which was published only in November 2018. As a result, tasks that are key to the institution of a proper monitoring and reporting framework such as preparation of baseline data were completed only in March 2019. Milestones have not been aligned with the timelines for achieving the targets. In the seven selected States, action on developing indicators and identification of data sources has not achieved required level of progress. The Committee were apprised in this regard that the NIF, with 306 indicators was devised by MoSPI in consultation with all stakeholders. Further, data in respect of 250 indicators is currently said to be available and for collecting the data for rest of the indicators, new surveys have reportedly been initiated. Some such surveys include the periodic Labour Force Survey (PLFS), Time Use Surveys (TUS), Situation Assessment Survey (SAS) on Agriculture Households Conditions etc. The Committee, while appreciating the steps initiated by MoSPI, desired to know as to when these surveys were initiated and the time frame by which the surveys would be completed. The Committee desired to be apprised of the results of these surveys and also desired that data in respect of the remaining milestones be compiled and made available expeditiously. While noting the fact that some of the indicators which are a part of the General Assembly resolution are treated as new in the Indian context for which, as informed by the Secretary, MoSPI, milestones have not been delineated as of now, and would be worked out in course of time, the Committee, recommended that MoSPI should initiate effective steps expeditiously so as to identify the milestones for all the indicators and commence working on these indicators in right earnest.

28. In their Action Taken Note NITI Aayog submitted as under:

> "MoSPI developed the NIF for SDGs, in sync with Global Indicator Framework (GIF), initially consisting of 306 national indicators (version 1.0) along with identified data sources and periodicity in consultation with concerned Ministries/Departments, UN Agencies and other stakeholders.
> The Union Cabinet, in its meeting held on 24.10.2018, approved the proposal of the Ministry on NIF for SDGs on constitution of High Level Steering Committee (HLSC) to periodically review and refine the NIF. Accordingly, the HLSC under the Chairmanship of Chief Statistician of India cum Secretary, MoSPI with members from NITI Aayog, Ministry of Home Affairs, Ministry of Health and FW, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, Ministry of Finance and MoSPI has been constituted to periodically review, refine and modify the NIF. Thenceforth, several initiatives have been taken by the MoSPI which inter-alia

include release of first Baseline Report on SDG-NIF, release of SDGs Dashboard, preparation and circulation of guidelines for States/UTs for development of State Indicator Framework, Capacity Development on SDGs for Central and State officials, launching of new surveys for bridging the data gaps by collecting data on certain indicators in the next round of National Sample Surveys, alignment of existing surveys as per SDG data requirements, etc.

The NIF is evolutionary in nature and is refined from time to time in consultation with line Ministries/Custodian Agencies. At present, the latest version of the NIF (Version 3.1) consists of 295 indicators and data is available on 266 indicators.

MoSPI has conducted several surveys, such as, the Periodic Labour Force Survey (PLFS), Time Use Surveys (TUS), Situation Assessment Survey (SAS) on Agriculture Households Conditions etc. to come out with relevant data for a number of indicators from the NIF.

With respect to initiating effective steps in order to identify the milestones for all the indicators and commence working on these indicators in right earnest, MoSPI had a meeting with NITI Aayog and thereafter the data source Ministries/Departments along with the line Ministries/Departments, responsible for implementation of respective SDGs, were requested to fix the milestones of the concerned SDG national indicators so as to monitor the progress made towards achieving the SDGs. The matter was rigorously followed with the line Ministries/Departments and 5 online workshops with concerned line Ministries/Departments were conducted so as to collectively resolve the issues relating to fixing the milestones.

While facilitating the concerned data source/implementing Ministries/Department in fixation the milestones for SDG indicators, the following challenges were faced:

i. The data source Ministries/Departments were different from the Implementing Ministries in respect of several SDG indicators because indicators were based on Survey/Census/other compiled statistics;

ii. For some of the SDG indicators, it was not feasible to set the milestones, especially budget related indicators;

iii. The data source Ministries/Departments suggested refinements in the some of the existing SDG indicators.

As per SDG NIF Progress Report 2021 (Version 3.1) released on 29th June, 2021; there are 295 indicators in the NIF and data is available for 266 indicators. With regard to these 266 national indicators for which data is available, the status on milestone setting is as under:

a. For 142 indicators either Milestones have been set or Ministries/Departments have provided inputs or have submitted that it is not feasible to set the milestones.

b. For the remaining indicators, the line Ministries/Departments have informed that they are still working with their concerned Divisions/Wings/Units or with other related Ministries (wherever applicable). MoSPI will continue to interact with the line Ministries/Departments for facilitating milestones fixing on remaining indicators.

29. In their Vetting Comments Audit observed that as data for 29 out of 295 National indicators is still not available, efforts made by MoSPI may be intimated to PAC.

30. ATN received from the NITI Aayog with respect to Vetting Comments is given as under:

> "MoSPI has released the Sustainable Development Goals-National Indicator Framework Progress Report 2021 (version 3.1) on 29th June 2021. At present, there are 295 indicators in National Indicator Framework (NIF), out of which data is available for 266 indicators. MoSPI has taken several steps for compiling data on the remaining 29 NIF indicators which inter-alia include conduct of a Multiple Indicator Survey (MIS) during 78th Round of National Sample Survey (NSS). Further, MoSPI is all set to launch a Comprehensive Annual Modular Survey (CAMS) as part of NSS 79th round to capture and compile data on some of the SDG indicators. Apart from this, MoSPI is rigorously pursuing with respective subject matter Ministries of the Government of India for getting data for remaining indicators."

31. **The Committee note from the ATNs that as per SDG NIF Progress Report, 2021, Version 3.1 (released on 29th June, 2021) there are 295 indicators in the NIF and data is available for 266 indicators. In regard to compiling data on the remaining 29 NIF indicators, several steps are stated to have been undertaken by the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation *viz.* launching a Comprehensive Annual Modular Survey (CAMS) as part of National Sample Survey (NSS) 79th round to capture and compile data on some of the indicators, pursuing the respective subject matter with Ministries of Government of India for getting data for remaining indicators etc. The Committee would like to know the present status of collecting the data for remaining indicators as a result of the aforesaid steps taken in this regard. Further, while providing status on milestone setting in regard to 266 national indicators, the Committee have been informed that for 142 indicators either milestones have been set or Ministries/Departments have provided the inputs or have submitted that it is not feasible to set the milestones. It has further been informed that MoSPI will continue to interact with the line Ministries/Departments for facilitating milestones fixing on remaining indicators. While appreciating the steps taken in this regard by the MoSPI, the Committee would desire that the work relating to fixing of milestones on remaining indicators be completed at the earliest so that the progress made**

towards achieving the SDGs could be effectively monitored. The Committee would like to be apprised of the present position in this regard.

VII. Integration of Policy Framework (Recommendation Para No. 15)

32. The Committee noted that the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare has initiated several measures that are supportive of achieving horizontal and vertical policy coherence. However, coherent policy initiatives have either been absent or inadequate in the States. In all the seven States, the Centre and the States have not been playing their respective roles effectively in a collaborative manner for achieving the intended outcomes. The Committee also felt anguished to note that with regard to the aspect of vertical coherence, a working group set up by the M/o H&FW for implementing Goal 3 in the States and UTs has not held any meeting. It was only after the issue was pointed out by the Committee in their sitting on 23 January, 2020, that the Working Group of the National Task Force held a meeting on 28 January, 2020. It was informed by the Ministry that the National Task Force reiterated the need for conducting regular meetings of the working groups and that necessary instructions have been communicated to all the officials concerned. While observing that mere issue of instructions would not produce the desired results unless these are complied with both in letter and spirit, the Committee recommended that the meetings of the Working Groups be held at regular intervals so as to suggest ways and means to achieve vertical as well as horizontal coherence on policy measures between the Centre and the State Governments. The Committee also desired to be apprised of the sittings of working groups held so far, the steps suggested by them to maintain policy coherence and the action taken by the Centre/States thereon.

33. In their Action Taken Note NITI Aayog stated as under:

> "The first meeting of the working group on the roll out of SDG-3 in States/UTs was held on 28th January 2020. Mapping of the SDG indicators was emphasised during the meeting. The working group suggested that the State/UTs are to be encouraged in developing their own State Indicator Framework (SIFs), in sync with the National Indicator Framework. Subsequently, due to the ongoing pandemic situation the meeting could not be convened."

34. Vetting Comments of Audit on the NITI Aayog's ATN is give as under:

"The Committee may be informed whether the possibility of virtual meetings have been explored for holding such meetings."

35. In their ATN with respect to Vetting Comments of Audit NITI Aayog stated that the subsequent meetings planned will also have the option of virtual participation.

36. **The Committee are astonished to note that since 28th January, 2020 no sitting of the Working Group set up by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare for effective implementation of Goal 3 in the States and UTs has been convened due to pandemic. The Committee are concerned to observe that after pointed out by Audit, during the course of vetting of Action Taken Notes, the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare decided to have the option of virtual participation for the subsequent meetings. The Committee cannot accept the reply of the Ministry as the steps for conducting virtual meetings should have been initiated earlier. The ATN is also silent about the meetings held so far and the corrective Action Taken by the Ministry on the suggestions made therein in regard to developing of State Indicator Framework in syc with the National Indicator Framework. The Committee would, therefore, desire to know about the present status of the meetings held by the Working Group till date either physically or virtually, the suggestions made therein to achieve vertical as well as horizontal coherence on Policy measures between Centre and the States and the steps taken by the Ministry thereon.**

VIII. Adequacy of Public Health Care Facilities (Recommendation Para No. 17)

37. The Committee were concerned to find that despite the prevalence of Plans/Policies as well as increase in allocations for augmenting physical and human resources, significant shortages continue to persist in regard to the physical resources in all seven States. As for human resources, there were considerable shortages in the States of Chhattisgarh and Uttar Pradesh. The Committee were of the considered view that the primary responsibility for attaining Goal-3 in an efficacious manner within the given timeframe lies with the Ministry of Health Family Welfare. The Committee advised

to post at least one MBBS Doctor in the Wellness Centres as para-medical personnel cannot prescribe medicines to the patients. Effective utilisation of the services of MBBS Doctors in the health care delivery system of India right from Wellness Centres, can possibly make a big difference in achieving the SD Goals. The Committee were also of the view that to prevent doctors from going abroad, suitable facilities and encouragement may be given to them to serve the people in the country. The Committee, therefore desire that with a view to improving health services in remote areas, at least one Allopathic doctor along with paramedical staff should be posted in each Wellness Centre. The Committee feel that there is also an imperative need to constantly monitor the functioning of Wellness Centres at regular intervals besides ensuring regular attendance of Doctors there so that the goal of providing affordable, effective and reliable health care, especially for the poor in the rural areas is achieved.

38. Action Taken Notes as furnished by the NITI Aayog is given as under:

"As per the operational guidelines of AYUSHMAN BHARAT – Comprehensive Primary Health Care through Health and Wellness Centres - The services envisaged at the Health and Wellness Centres (HWC) level include early identification, basic management, counselling, ensuring treatment adherence, follow up care, ensuing continuity of care by appropriate referrals, optimal home and community follow up, and health promotion and prevention for the expanded range of services. The primary health care teams at the SHCs led by the Community Health Officers (CHO) are trained to provide first level of management and triage, i.e. refer the patient to the appropriate health facility for treatment and follow up. The Medical Officer (MBBS) at the PHCs/UPHCs would be responsible for ensuring that Comprehensive Primary Health Care services are delivered through all SHCs-HWCs in her/his area. Further, teleconsultations are done by the CHOs at SHCs with Medical Officers (MO) at PHC level or MO at State/District level Hubs and subsequently medicines are dispensed by the CHO based on the prescriptions of these MO. Similarly, specialist teleconsultations services are being provided between MO at PHC and specialist at State/District level Hubs. As on 11th August 2021, 91.66 Lakhs such teleconsultation services (e-sanjeevani HWC consultations - 46.11 lakhs and e-sanjeevani OPD consultations – 45.5 Lakhs) have been provided."

39. Vetting Comments of Audit on the aforesaid Action Taken Note are as follows:

"Ministry has not furnished details on the following recommendations of PAC:

(i) Steps taken to post at least one Allopathic doctor along with paramedical staff in each Wellness Centre to improve health services in remote areas, and
(ii) Steps taken to constantly monitor the functioning of Wellness Centres at regular intervals besides ensuring regular attendance of doctors."

40. ATN with respect to Vetting Comments is given as under:

"(i) Under Ayushman Bharat – Health and Wellness Centres (AB-HWCs), as on 22.09.2021, there are 21,290 PHC-HWCs (Rural Primary Health Centre) and 4,135 UPHC-HWCs (Urban Primary Health Centre) are functional where at-least one MBBS (Allopathic) Doctors are posted to cater to the healthcare needs.

(ii)To monitor the functioning of the HWCs following measure are taken.

a) Constant monitoring on the implementation of CPHC services closer to the population through HWCs, happen through regular review meetings & Video conferences to provide required technical handholding and financial support.

b) This regular review and monitoring have enabled the achievement of FY 2020-21 target of 70,000 HWCs, well ahead of time by converting the existing SHCs, PHCs and UPHCs into HWCs. The State/UTs were able to operationalise 74,947 against the target of 70,000 HWCs by 31st March 2021.

c) Regional review conferences are organised regularly from FY 2018-19, clustering with group of State/UTs to review the implementation challenges.

d) The performance of State in operationalisation of HWCs is documented regularly and placed in public domain (http://117.239.180.230/hwc/live application/hwc/home /new releases).

e) Further, under Incentive conditionality under NHM Framework from FY 2020-21 has an indicator for achieving the target for operationalisation of HWCs.

f) Moreover, third-party evaluation of HWCs is undertaken for the performance of HWCs in FY 2019-20 and FY 2020-21 and the report will be released soon.

NITI Aayog also suggested that 2% of functional HWCs are to be evaluated independently by Third party."

41. **The Committee note that with a view to monitoring the functioning of Wellness Centres at regular intervals so as to achieve the goal of providing affordable, effective and reliable health care, especially for the poor in the rural areas, several steps are stated to have been taken by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare such as (i) constant monitoring on the implementation of CPHC services closer to the population through HWCs, regular review meetings and video conferences, (ii) regular organisation of Regional review conferences from FY 2018-19, clustering with group of States/UTs to review the implementation challenges; (iii) regular documentation of performance of State in operationalisation of HWCs and placing the same in public domain, (iv)**

conducting Third-Party evaluation of HWCs in FY 2019-20 and FY 2020-21 and (v) evaluation of 2% of functional HWCs independently by Third-Party. While taking note of the steps taken by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, the Committee desire that these measures should be constantly reviewed for making the SDGs more purposeful and focused so as to facilitate the growth and development of Health Sector and enhance their competitiveness to meet the challenges of globalization. Further, as regards the Third Party evaluation of HWCs undertaken in 2019-20 & 2020-21, the Committee have been informed that the Report of this evaluation would be released soon. The Committee would like to know the current status of release of evaluation Report, the Observations/Recommendations contained therein, and the action taken by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare thereon.

IX. Addressing the shortcomings highlighted (Recommendation Para No. 19)

42. The Committee felt that the best practices for achieving the SDGs as followed by various States should be studied in depth by the M/oH&FW and wherever feasible, replicated in the States where deficiencies are noticed. The Committee also recommended that the Ministry should also conduct a study of the best healthcare systems prevailing in other countries - both developed and developing, so that the health schemes could be restructured accordingly to make the achievement of Sustainable Development Goals a grand success. In particular, the Ministry should study the Cuba model, which is considered to be one of the best health care system in the world.

43. Action Taken by the NITI Aayog is as under:

> "Under the Innovation summit of NHM an additional category for best practices for implementation of State Specific intervention towards achievement of SDGs will be included. Further, the Ministry also will study the Cuba model of health care system to learn the good practices."

44. In the Vetting Comments Audit stated that conclusive action is yet to be taken on PAC's recommendation.

45. **The Committee observe that on the recommendation of the Committee regarding conducting a study of the best healthcare systems prevailing in other**

countries (both developed and developing) particularly the 'Cuba Model', the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare submitted that under the Innovation Summit of NHM, an additional category for best practices for implementation of State specific intervention towards achievement of SDGs would be included. The Committee are dismayed to find that the Ministry have not taken any concrete steps for implementation of their recommendation. Obviously, the matter has not been addressed seriously and the failure of the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare to act upon the specific recommendation of the Committee is quiet evident in this case. What is further disquieting is that the Ministry failed to take any effort towards study of the best healthcare systems in other countries as well as the 'Cuba Model'. While expressing deep dissatisfaction over the inaction and apathy displayed by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare in the matter, the Committee would like the Ministry to address the matter seriously and take all necessary and effective measures to ensure that the study as recommended by the Committee is conducted at the earliest. The Committee would like to be informed of the status of such study within a period of three months.

CHAPTER II

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

Observation/Recommendation No. 1:

India's Commitment to Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

The 70th session of the UN General Assembly held on 25th September, 2015 adopted the document titled "Transforming our World: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development" comprising 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and 169 associated targets. The SDGs seek to address not only the root causes of poverty but also the universal need for development to provide a life of dignity to all and are the most comprehensive list of global goals integrating the Social, economic and environmental dimensions of development both for present and future generations. It also endeavours to create conditions for inclusive and sustained economic growth, shared prosperity and decent work for al. It envisages achievement of 21 Targets by 2020, three targets by 2025 and remaining Targets by 2030. Countries have the primary responsibility for follow-up and review, at the national, sub-national and lower levels with regard to the progress made in implementing the goals and targets over the next 15 years. Though not legally binding, the SDGs have become *defacto* international obligations and will re-orient domestic spending priorities during the next fifteen years. Implementation of SDGs and their success will rely on countries own sustainable development policies, plans and programmes.

In this Assembly, Government of India affirmed its commitment to the 2030 Agenda and SDGs. In regard to implementation of 2030 Agenda in India, Government of India entrusted (September 2015) National Institution for Transforming India (NITI Aayog) with the responsibility of coordinating and overseeing the implementation of the 2030 Agenda. NITI Aayog was specifically given the task of identifying national targets and assigning them to Ministries/Departments concerned for implementation of SDGs in India. In addition, it has been tasked (May 2016) to formulate, a longer vision of 15 years keeping in view the social goals and SDGs, a Seven Year Strategy document as part of "National Development Agenda" and a Three Year Action Agenda for goals to be achieved. NITI Aayog involved the states and UTs Government in the preparedness exercise by associating them with the formulation of the Vision and Strategy documents and advising them to undertake mapping of Goals and Targets with various departments, while building their institutional capacities for implementing, monitoring and evaluation of the SDGs. Further, Ministry of Statistics and programme Implementation (MoSPI) is responsible for the development of the National Indicator Framework (NIF) for measuring the progress of the SDGs and associated targets. MoSPI is also making efforts to ensure that State Governments and UTs have guidance and capacities to monitor the SDGs at the state and Lower levels. Ministry of Health & Family welfare was given the responsibility of Goal-3 of SDGs i.e. "Good Health and well being" which is intended to ensure healthy living and promote well-being of people of all ages.

The committee's examination of the subject is based on the Audit review of the preparedness of the Government for the implementation of Sustainable

Development Goals. Audit selected seven States (Assam, Chhattisgarh, Haryana, Kerala, Maharashtra, Uttar Pradesh and west Bengal) on the basis of ranking (both high and low) of Health indices for 2015-16. The purpose of the review, as stated, is to ascertain the extent to which the Government adapted the 2030 Agenda into its national context, extent to which the Government identified and secured resources and capacities needed to implement the 2030 Agenda, to assess the robustness and accuracy of procedures put in place to track the allocation of resources against targets within the SDGs and the extent to which the Government established a mechanism to monitor, follow-up review and report on the progress towards the implementation of the 2030 Agenda. Examination of the subject by the Committee in detail has revealed that there have been certain deficiencies in the preparedness for implementation of SDGs. The Committee have dealt with the various aspects of the preparedness for the implementation of Sustainable Development Goals in the subsequent Paragraphs.

(Sl. No. 1; Appendix II; Para No.1 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

NITI Aayog has executed the tasks assigned to it with regard to the implementation of SDGs in the context of its Allocation of Business Rules. For the purpose, it is working in partnership with Central Ministries, and States and UTs according to the principles of cooperative federalism.

MoSPI developed a National Indicator Framework (NIF) for SDGs, in sync with Global Indicator Framework (GIF), initially consisting of 306 national indicators (version 1.0) along with identified data sources and periodicity in consultation with concerned Ministries/Departments, UN Agencies and other stakeholders. Further, in compliance to Cabinet decision, a High Level Steering Committee (HLSC) on SDG under the Chairmanship of the Chief Statistician of India cum Secretary, MoSPI with members from NITI Aayog, M/o Home Affairs, M/o Health and Family Welfare, M/o Environment, Forest and Climate Change, M/o Finance and MoSPI has been constituted to periodically review, refine and modify the NIF.

Similar to GIF, the NIF is evolutionary in nature. MoSPI, in consultation with line Ministries/Departments and Custodian Agencies, examines the suitability of existing indicators as well as new indicators for the relevant target(s) and periodically review and refine the NIF. At present, the NIF (Version 3.1) consists of 295 indicators and data is available on 266 indicators. Further, MoSPI is providing technical support to States/UTs in development of their State Indicator Frameworks (SIFs).

Vetting Comments of Audit

No Comments.

Observation/Recommendation No. 2

Efforts towards mainstreaming activities pertaining to SDGs

The Committee note that NITIAayog has undertaken several multi-disciplinary stakeholder consultations and conducted periodic reviews with States and UTs for mainstreaming activities such as preparation of vision/strategy documents; creation of nodal structures; mapping of targets; capacity building for implementing, monitoring and evaluation; formulation of state-specific indicators and orienting budgets with SDGs. However, preparation of a roadmap with defined milestones aligned with SDG targets to be achieved was

not initiated till the time of presentation of the Audit Report. Apprising the reasons for not initiating measures towards drawing up the roadmap initially, NITI Aayog stated that as these targets have already been specified in the 2030 Agenda which was endorsed by India along with other countries, it was felt that identification of separate milestones may not be necessary. Further to this, NITI Aayog informed that they have been working closely with all the States to create their SDG roadmaps to achieve the milestones as per the SDG targets and most of the States have already developed their SDG roadmaps. The committee, in this regard, note that milestones for the SDGs have been a part of the 2030 Agenda. For achieving these milestones, comprehensive and co-ordinated efforts of all stakeholders is a necessity. What the committee find to be surprising to note is that the nodal institution, NITI Aayog pursued the matter with the States for developing the roadmaps only after the issue was pointed out by Audit. The Committee, in this regard, express the view that the apparently inappropriate attitude displayed at the initial stage towards a commitment made by India in the United Nations may have a bearing on the good standing the country has in the pursuit of SDGs. The Committee, therefore, exhort NITI Aayog to take suitable measures to compensate for the delayed action. Also, it may be preferable to clearly specify NITI Aayog's role in implementation of SDGs in the Allocation of Business. The committee would also like to have details of the current status of development of roadmaps by all the Statas/UTs and remedial measures taken against the defaulting States/UTs.

(Sl. No. 2; Appendix II; Para No.2 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

A roadmap usually includes objectives, milestones, deliverables and planned timeline. NITI Aayog has been working with the States and UTs right from the year 2016 to help develop these key elements of the SDG roadmap. As has also been maintained before, objectives and milestones are clearly enunciated in the SDGs and associated targets as endorsed by India along with other countries. Vision Documents of States and UTs reconfirm the SDGs, indicate strategies to achieve them and also inform about programmes and initiatives being implemented in that direction. The SDG mapping of schemes/programmes and departments also reorient them in the direction of SDG implementation. The monitoring of schemes and programmes is further focused by the adoption of State SDG Indicator Frameworks, which are prepared in consistency with the National Indicator Framework and also by addressing the contextual specificities of respective States. Monitoring conducted along the indicators help in focusing on deliverables (programme outputs) in keeping with the timeline. As of now, most States (except Goa, Kerala, Meghalaya, Odisha, Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu, Telangana, and West Bengal) and some UTs (except Chandigarh, Jammu and Kashmir, Ladakh, Lakshadweep, and Dadra and Nagar Haveli and Daman and Diu) have Vision Documents. Similarly, most States (except Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Maharashtra, Punjab and Telangana, where it is under preparation) and some UTs (Andaman and Nicobar Islands and Delhi) have already prepared State Indicator Framework. NITI Aayog is continuously following up with the States and UTs for preparation and use of State Indicator Framework for monitoring.

The SDG India Index computed annually since 2018 has played a very effective role in goading States and UTs in their efforts towards implementation and achievement of SDGs. It brings out the status of States and UTs in terms of SDG achievement based on latest available data and ranks their performance. India is internationally

acknowledged as a pioneering country to have developed, adopted and regularly used such a tool in monitoring SDG achievement at national and subnational levels.

Vetting Comments of Audit

NITI Aayog had not responded to the PAC's recommendation regarding clearly specifying its role in implementation of SDGs in the Allocation of Business.

Preparation of Vision Document and State Indicator Framework is yet to be completed by all the States/UTs. As desired by PAC, measures taken against the defaulting States/UTs may be elucidated.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

It is not for NITI Aayog to modify the Allocation of Business Rules.

With regard to ensuring that States/UTs prepare Vision Document and State Indicator Framework, measures taken by NITI Aayog fall into three categories. NITI Aayog takes up the matter in meetings with the States/UTs concerned. Second, it brings up the issues in common reviews with States and presses for action. Third, the SDG India Index Report records the performance of States and UTs in the context of comparison and ranking, which has substantial influencing and persuasive power.

Observation/Recommendation No. 3

Meetings of the Multi-Disciplinary Task Force

The committee find that apart from directly reviewing the work on SDGs in the state and central Ministries, NITI Aayog had constituted in August 2017 a multi-disciplinary Task Force to analyse and review implementation of SDGs. Though the Task Force was required to meet at least once in each quarter, the Committee find that it has held only two meetings since its constitution. It has been merely informed to the committee that the last meeting of the Task Force was held during the preparation of VNR Report 2020 and no explanation has been given for not holding the meetings at quarterly intervals. The Committee, while expecting a suitable explanation in this regard also impress upon NITI Aayog on the need for arranging meetings at quarterly intervals so that the suggestions/feedback may become available more frequently, and consequently boost the monitoring process. The Committee may also be apprised of the outcome of the sitting(s) of the Task Force.

(Sl. No. 3; Appendix II; Para No.3 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

The membership of the SDG Task Force comprised four representatives from NITI Aayog, one each from the Ministry of External Affairs and the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, one from the National Institute of Public Finance and Policy (NIPFP), one from the Research and Development System for Developing Countries (RIS) as well as one representative each from three State Governments and one Central Ministry on an annual rotation basis. Experience showed that the participation of Central Ministries and State Governments was limited and restrictive and likely to generate a sense of exclusion in other States/UTs not part of the Task Force on a regular basis. Participation of experts also needed to be more broad-based. Therefore, after the 2020 VNR preparatory meeting, no other meeting of the said Task Force has been undertaken, primarily due to the challenges

imposed by the pandemic. While a more widely sourced technical consultative group is being formed, regular consultations with States and UTs have continued.

Vetting Comments of Audit

PAC may take a suitable view of Ministry's reply that no other meeting of the Task Force has been undertaken after the 2020 VNR preparatory meeting. Further, composition of technical consultative group being formed along with outcomes of meetings of the said group may be furnished to PAC.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

With a view to accessing broader consultative and technical support, the SDG Task Force has been reconstituted on 20.09.2021 with Vice Chairman, NITI Aayog as the Chair. The membership of the Task Force has now been expanded to include eight Central Ministries/Departments and all States/UTs on a regular basis. This improves the strategic compass of the Task Force and the expertise at its disposal. The next meeting will be scheduled in the 2nd half of October 2021.

Observation/Recommendation No. 4

Designation of Nodal Ministries for SDGs

The Committee find that in the revised mapping document issued by the NITI Aayog in August 2018, the aspect of designating a specific Ministry as being the nodal Ministry for specific SDGs has been done away with. The Committee are of the view in this regard that this may lead to lack of proper accountability, and monitoring by NITI Aayog only may not help in achieving the desired results.

(Sl. No.4; Appendix II; Para No.4 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

As the mapping of Ministries and schemes revealed, each SDG involved engagement of and implementation by a number of Ministries/Departments. Each Ministry played an equally important role and allocation of the nodal function to one of them was often arbitrary. On the other hand, Ministries have similar collaborative linkage across many SDGs and related targets on account of interconnectedness of SDGs. So, there are equally important interactive correlations among Ministries both horizontally and vertically, which have been indicated in the 2018 version of the mapping document. In this context, allocation of the nodal function to one Ministry for each SDG was found to be deficient and arbitrary. Instead, a model of free-flowing collaboration at the level of policy, schemes and programmes was opted for in which each Ministry is encouraged to work with all relevant actors including other Ministries/Departments, which are identified in the mapping document.

Vetting Comments of Audit

The Committee's concern regarding ensuring proper accountability and monitoring has not been addressed in the reply.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

It is submitted that by the allocation of responsibilities of the Ministries in the revised mapping in a more specific manner at the level of SDG targets along with the identification of interconnectedness across the Ministries/Departments improves

monitorability and sharpens accountability. This also allows for better inter-sectoral coordination and convergence.

Observation/Recommendation No. 5

Preparation of "15 Year Vision Document"

The Committee are concerned to note that the "I5 Year Vision Document" which is to serve as the basis for the strategy and Action Agenda document is yet to be released although five years have passed. The Committee are appreciative of the intention of NITI Aayog to make the vision Document broad based and integrally focused on States expectations and priorities owing to which importance has been given to obtain inputs from the Ministries and the States. As informed, NITI Aayog is in the process of reviewing and finalizing the draft document and has assigned the work to a multi-disciplinary team. While the Vision Document was expected to be finalized by March, 2020, the process of preparation of the Document is said to have been severely affected due to COVID-19 pandemic. What the Committee find to be intriguing in this regard is that it was only after the Audit pointed out this issue, that NITI Aayog took the initiative of assigning the work to a multi-disciplinary team. The reply of NITI Aayog is also silent on the date on which the multi-disciplinary team was constituted and by when the vision Document is now likely to be finalised. The committee would await conclusive details in this regard.

(Sl. No. 5; Appendix II; Para No.5 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

The work on the preparation of the Vision Document has been underway for the last two years. However, preparation has been delayed due to the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic. The impact of the pandemic has necessitated re-working of the growth models, assumptions and requires new sets of data to project key economic indicators for the next 15 years incorporating the post-COVID reality. Taking this into account, the exercise of making fresh projections has commenced and preparation of the Vision Document is expected to be completed by March 2022.

Vetting Comments of Audit

Final action is awaited.

Observation/Recommendation No. 6

Preparation for achieving the SDG Goals

So far as the preparation for achieving the goals at the State level is concerned, the Committee feels perturbed to note that the work on Vision/Strategy/Action Agenda documents in Uttar Pradesh and West Bengal were at preparatory stage. Kerala had prepared a Perspective plan, 2030 in the year 2014 but the Plan has not been reviewed and realigned with SDGs. Chhattisgarh had published its Vision 2030 document in March 2019. The Committee also regret to observe that the mapping exercise undertaken in the selected States was not comprehensive. For instance, certain schemes/Goals/Targets have reportedly not been mapped at all in Assam, Chhattisgarh, Haryana, Maharashtra and Uttar Pradesh. The Committee have been informed that NITI Aayog has advised the States to do their own mapping in the light

of the mapping done at the Central level. NITI Aayog has also been persuading the States and UTs from time to time to accelerate this process. The Committee are constrained to observe that NITI Aayog has not explained the reasons for slow progress at the State level and the obstacles the States may have been facing in adopting/implementing the SDGs. The Committee are appreciative of the stance towards localizing the SDGs. However, as the monitoring agency, NITI Aayog needs to identify and recognize the difficulties faced by different States, assist in addressing them and apprise the Committee of the same. The Committee also desire that NITI Aayog pursue the matter with the defaulting states for expeditious completion of the required documents and put in place an effective co-ordinating/monitoring mechanism in order to fast track the achievement of the SDGs and related targets.

(Sl. No.6; Appendix II; Para No.6 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

NITI Aayog continues to follow up with the States with respect to localisation of SDGs. States excepting those of Goa, Kerala, Meghalaya, Odisha, Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu, Telangana and West Bengal have completed/adopted their Vision 2030. All the States have also completed their mapping documents and reviewed their mapping of schemes with a view to making them comprehensive.

In the context of SDG localisation, States have increasingly laid emphasis on monitoring of SDG implementation and assessment of progress. All the States, except the State of Punjab, have State Indicator Frameworks (SIF) in place. The SIFs are extremely useful in monitoring of various schemes and tracking of outputs/outcomes thereof as relevant to corresponding SDG targets. States have put in place high level institutional mechanisms under the leadership of senior officials to review progress on a regular basis. In course of the last one year, NITI Aayog has extensively visited the States (Assam, Meghalaya, Odisha, Gujarat, Karnataka, Kerala, Himachal Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, Jharkhand, Arunachal Pradesh, Uttar Pradesh, Uttarakhand, Andhra Pradesh, Sikkim among others) to orient key government officials on general issues of SDGs, the SDG India Index, Indicator Frameworks and tracking of progress.

NITI Aayog is also working with laggard States on the matters of concern. For instance, after the release of the SDG India Index 2020-21 on 3rd June 2021, the NITI Aayog team is visiting the States to discuss progress on SDG implementation, highlight issues and concerns and explore remedial measures at the highest level – in many cases involving the Chief Ministers. So far, the States of Assam, Meghalaya, Odisha, Gujarat, Karnataka, Kerala, Himachal Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, Jharkhand, Arunachal Pradesh, Uttar Pradesh, Uttarakhand, Andhra Pradesh, Sikkim and Nagaland have already been visited.

Vetting Comments of Audit

Reply is silent on putting in place an effective coordinating/monitoring mechanism in order to fast track the achievement of the SDGs and related targets.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

In the submission above, NITI Aayog's role and function in coordination and monitoring of SDG implementation has been described. Further, the reconstituted SDG Task Force will play an important role in strengthening the monitoring and coordination process.

Observation/Recommendation No. 7

Public Awareness Programmes

The Committee note that as per the United Nations Development Group (UNDG) Reference Guide titled 'Mainstreaming the 2030 Agenda', raising awareness is one of the key means to achieve the SDGs. This includes Planning, issuing instructions and action for awareness and IEC (Information, Education and communication) activities for Government officials and others viz. civil society, general public, institutions etc. The Committee have noticed in this regard that the awareness programmes on SDGs have not been extended to educational institutions, students and youth organisations. The Committee are of opinion that there is a need to share the commitments for the future with the younger generation. The Committee would, therefore, expect to be apprised of the measures taken in this direction.

(Sl. No. 7; Appendix II; Para No.7 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

NITI Aayog has involved representatives of universities and other educational institutions in all its national and regional consultations on SDGs. Its civil society partners have also carried forward sensitisation of students and youth on the SDGs across the country. With respect to extending exclusive awareness programmes on SDGs to educational institutions, students and youth organisations, NITI Aayog is encouraging State Governments and civil society organisations to take up planned interventions in this regard.

Vetting Comments of Audit

No comments.

Observation/Recommendation No. 8

Consultations with Stakeholders

The Committee also note that building awareness of the SDGs and adoption of a participatory multi-stakeholder approach is aimed at ensuring inclusive, effective and sustainable implementation of the 2030 Agenda. The Committee are, however, concerned to note that (i) there have been delays in finalising outcome of these consultations and placing the reports in public domain; (ii) in case of most consultations, definite outcomes and recommendations for time-bound follow up action were not identified owing to which there was limited assurance that the deliberations enabled in shaping the roadmap/policies for SDGs; (iii) according to its website, SRI workshops on SDG related issues have not been held post March 2017; (iv) extent and effectiveness of efforts made by stakeholders to increase public awareness is not ascertainable in the absence of feedback; (v) no centralised public awareness campaign has been envisaged; (vi) absence of dedicated awareness measures for general public may dilute the objective of making the

2030 Agenda inclusive and participatory; and (vii) five out of the 15 Ministries where this aspect was reviewed were yet to initiate/report any capacity building exercise. The committee are also constrained to observe that efforts to raise public awareness about SDGs and initiatives undertaken in the seven selected States have not been comprehensive, focussed and sustained. On this aspect too, NITI Aayog has averred that the onus of implementing schemes and programmes to achieve SDGs rests with the States and the relevant administrative Ministries. The committee, in this regard, also express the view that awareness and communication campaigns would be more effective if they are tailored to the context, language, values and resources accessible to the local stakeholders and audiences. To this end, NITI Aayog is reportedly taking measures towards motivating the States/UTs and other stakeholder to take up specific and targeted awareness initiatives. Also, public awareness programmes that are being undertaken being of a subdued nature, do not seem to be very effective in terms of outreach. The Committee desire that NII Aayog should have an Interactive web page to reach out to the States and the general public. The committee, in this regard, would also like to know whether fresh series of stakeholder consultations have been conducted. The Committee would await the details of the outcome of these consultations.

(Sl. No.8; Appendix II; Para No.8 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

The pages on SDGs in NITI Aayog website do provide elaborate information on SDGs generally and their pursuit in India. After regular publication of annual SDG India Index Reports, an interactive dashboard has been added which can be used to generate customised information with regard to performance on SDGs both at State/UT and national level according to the user's needs and convenience. NITI Aayog is on the continuous lookout to improve the content, accessibility and user-friendliness of its SDG webpages.

NITI Aayog has developed a capacity development module for senior government officials with the help of the Administrative Staff College of India which is ready to be rolled out after the COVID-19 situation eases out.

NITI Aayog is also initiating a series of Regional Consultations to cover all the States/UTs. The first of the Consultations has been conducted in the North Eastern Region during 12-14 April 2021, which extensively involved government officials at State as well as district levels. Based on a consensus in the consultation, a regional SDG District Indicator Framework has been developed which is being used to bring out a regional District Index Report to monitor SDG performance at the district level. It is expected to accelerate the implementation process at district and sub-district level and contribute significantly to bettering progress on the ground in all the North Eastern States. In a similar perspective, other regional consultations are planned to be rolled out after greater normalcy is attained across the country in the fight with the COVID-19 pandemic.

As mentioned above, simultaneously, NITI Aayog has continued sensitisation and capacity building workshops at the State level attuned to the felt needs of the government officials and allied stakeholders. During 2020-21, these workshops have been held in Assam, Meghalaya, Odisha, Gujarat, Karnataka, Kerala, Himachal Pradesh, Tamil Nadu, Jharkhand, Arunachal Pradesh, Uttar Pradesh, Uttarakhand, Andhra Pradesh, Sikkim and Nagaland.

Vetting Comments of Audit

As desired by PAC, details of outcome of consultation meetings organized by NITI Aayog may be provided.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

The meetings with the State governments have focused on the following: status of progress on SDGs; progress of SDG localization initiatives; State Indicator Frameworks and data on indicators; issues of progress and performance on different SDGs and related targets; and preparation ofreform action plans needed to improve performance.

Several outcomes have been generated: clarity on SDG targets/indicators and data; identification of areas of improvement in SDG localization initiatives and programme implementation pertaining to relevant SDG targets; and reform action plans to address areas of improvement.

NITI Aayog (Ministry of Planning)

Observation/Recommendation No. 9

Participation of the private sector and NGOs

The Committee have also looked into the possible role, the private sector and NGOs could play in achieving the SDGs. The means by way of which Businesses source, invest, employ and spend, have a significant influence on sustainable development. The comprehensive framework of the SDGs necessitate that the growing strength of the private sector in terms of finance, technology, skills, innovation and outreach is appropriately harnessed so as to ensure that the SDG implementation efforts are fructified. The Committee note in this regard that in the view of NITI Aayog, the Private sector can become a key factor in implementing SDGs and enabling sustained economic growth, social inclusion and environmental protection. Thus, it would be imperative to enable the private sector to go beyond its core business activities and start helping in technology transfer, capacity development, creation of public goods for the poor and efficient implementation of policies and programmes to achieve the SDG targets. Similarly, the Committee have also enquired about the role of NGOs and noted that the NGOs involved in charity work/not-for-profit organisations are also an important partner in implementation of SDGs. They have all along been part of the sensitization and awareness development work of NITI Aayog. NITI Aayog have informed the Committee that NGOs have also supported them in their own awareness and capacity development work on the SDGs at the grassroots and other levels. Those working with disadvantaged communities directly or indirectly are contributing to the work of social inclusion so that 'no one is left behind'. NITI Aayog partnered with a number of such organisations and their networks in 2019-20 to hold nation-wide consultations on all SDGs with various vulnerable social groups such as, children, women, farmers, people from Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, migrant labour, elderly, people with disabilities, people with HIV, etc. The outcome of the consultations have been incorporated in the VNR Report. The Committee desire that NITI Aayog frame detailed guidelines for the Private Sector to enable the sector to channel their resources and activities towards achievement of SDGs. Businesses need to be invited to apply their creativity and innovation towards solving sustainable development challenges and engaged as partners in the development process. The Committee further desire that NGOs and similar organisations involved in charity work are apprised of SDGs through various means and they may be

encouraged to participate in the awareness programme on SDGs. The committee would await details of the action taken in this regard.

(Sl. No.9; Appendix II; Para No.9 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

With the support of NITI Aayog, the Ministry of Corporate Affairs has prepared and issued the 'National Guidelines for Responsible Business Conduct (NGRBCs)' and the Business Responsibility and Sustainability Report (BRSR) formats through 2019-2020, which fully factors in SDGs and enables the private sector to align its initiatives and investments with SDGs. These guidelines are fairly detailed and prepared based on adequate stakeholder consultations. Further, in order to steer and stimulate private sector investments towards achievement of SDGs, the SDG Investor Map for India has been launched jointly by NITI Aayog, UNDP and Invest India – the National Investment Promotion and Facilitation Agency. This market intelligence tool provides localized data and specific information on SDG-aligned investment and business opportunities and contributes to an enabling environment for impactful partnerships between investors, industry, policy makers and elected representatives. Going forward, the SDG Marketplace, a web- based technology Platform, is being jointly developed by NITI Aayog, UNDP and Primus Partners (a management consultancy firm working as technical partner) to facilitate SDG-linked investments in India. This platform seeks to address the information asymmetry faced by various investors, facilitate matchmaking between investors and implementing agencies, link risk capital and private investment, and incentivise funding into the SDGs and geographies that most need it. Six States, such as, Chhattisgarh, Gujarat, Haryana, Maharashtra, Punjab, and Rajasthan have expressed interest to be part of the 1st pilot programme. Thus, NITI Aayog continues to engage with private sector organisations and their networks to strengthen partnerships and help harness their creativity, innovation and other resources in the implementation of the SDGs. On the other hand, NITI Aayog also continues to link with NGOs and other civil society organisations for information communication and awareness generation work on SDGs.

Vetting Comments of Audit

The details of NITI Aayog's engagement with NGOs and Civil society organisations may also be furnished to the Committee.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

In all national and regional SDG consultations, NITI Aayog has invited a number of active and relevant NGOs and civil society organisations (CSOs). In the Voluntary National Review (VNR) 2020, about 1000 NGOs/CSOs participated. In collaboration with them 14 national consultations and 20 subnational consultations were organized to discuss the situation and issues of various vulnerable communities as follows: (i) Adivasis; (ii) Adolescents, Youth and Youth Workers; (iii) Children; (iv) Dalits; (v) Victims of forced labour and human trafficking (vi) De-notified, Nomadic and Semi-Nomadic Tribes; (vii) Elderly; (viii) Farmers; (ix) Migrants and Urban Poor; (x) North-Eastern Region; (xi) People Living with HIV (PLHIVs); (xii) Persons with Disabilities (PWDs); (xiii) Sexual Minorities (lesbians, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer, intersex, asexual plus); and (xiv) Women. The issues, concerns and recommendations emerging from the consultations were included in the VNR2020 report.

Observation/Recommendation No. 10

Mobilisation of Resources for Implementation of SDG Agenda

The committee further observe that the 2030 Agenda lays stress on identifying and securing all means, including the financial resources required for implementation of the Agenda. The Voluntary National Review Report and the Three Year Action Agenda have highlighted several steps taken by the Government for optimizing domestic resource mobilisation. However, no comprehensive exercise for assessing and identifying the financial resources required for implementing SDGs has been undertaken either by the Ministry of Finance at the Centre or by the selected States. No steps have been initiated at the Central level for integrating SDGs in national budgeting and most of the selected States were only at the preliminary stage of orienting their budget with SDGs even after 5 years following the General Assembly Resolution. According to NITI Aayog, under the Central Sector Schemes, the relevant line Ministry/Department hold discussions/consultations with the State Governments in order to achieve the national goals which also involves discussions on the financial requirements for the same. The Ministries/Departments, based on the sharing pattern make projections of financial requirements to the Ministry of Finance which appraise and approve the desired financial assistance. The Committee find that NITI Aayog has not been able to apprise the Committee of the steps taken towards integration of SDG related financial resources in national budgeting. It was only after the Committee took up the subject for examination, that NITI Aayog took the initiative of conducting a study by the Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs) jointly with the International Monetary Fund (IMF) for estimating the financial resources needed to achieve the SDGs in the areas of education, health, electricity, roads and water and sanitation. The study Report is currently stated to be under finalization. The Committee trust that the study would be completed expeditiously. The Committee would also like to be apprised of the outcome of the study and follow up action taken thereon by the NITI Aayog and Ministry of Finance (Department of Economic Affairs). The committee are of the view in this regard even in the likelihood of harmonizing the SDGs with the Central Sector Schemes, the benefit towards achieving SDGs should be clearly delineated so that India can showcase the country's achievement.

(Sl. No. 10; Appendix II; Para No.10 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

The study conducted by Ministry of Finance (D/o Economic Affairs) jointly with International Monetary Fund (IMF) for estimating the financial resources needed to achieve SDGs in the areas of education, health, electricity, roads and water and sanitation is under finalisation.

Vetting Comments of Audit

The probable date of finalization of study report may be intimated to PAC,

Observation/Recommendation No. 11

National Indicator Framework (NIF)

The Committee note that for enabling monitoring and review, the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation (MoSPI) has been entrusted with the

task of developing a National Indicator Framework (NIF) which was published only in November 2018. As a result, tasks that are a key to the institution of a proper monitoring and reporting framework such as preparation of baseline data were completed only in March 2019. Milestones have not been aligned with the timelines for achieving the targets. In the seven selected States, action on developing indicators and identification of data sources has not achieved required level of progress. The Committee have been apprised in this regard that the NIF, with 306 indicators was devised by MoSPI in consultation with all stakeholders. Further, data in respect of 250 indicators is currently said to be available and for collecting the data for rest of the indicators, new surveys have reportedly been initiated. Some such surveys include the periodic Labour Force Survey (PLFS), Time Use Surveys (TUS), Situation Assessment Survey (SAS) on Agriculture Households Conditions etc. The Committee, while appreciating the steps initiated by MoSPI, in this regard would like to know as to when these surveys were initiated and the time frame by which the surveys would be completed. The Committee would also like to be apprised of the results of these surveys and desire that data in respect of the remaining milestones be compiled and made available expeditiously. The Committee also note the fact that some of the indicators which are a part of the General Assembly resolution are treated as new in the Indian context for which, as informed by the Secretary, MoSPI, milestones have not been delineated as of now, and would be worked out in course of time. The Committee feel that non-identification of milestones may affect the preparations of an effective roadmap/policy for achieving the related targets. The Committee, therefore, recommend that MoSPI should initiate effective steps expeditiously so as to identify the milestones for all the indicators and commence working on these indicators in right earnest.

(Sl. No.11; Appendix II; Para No.11 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

MoSPI developed the NIF for SDGs, in sync with Global Indicator Framework)GIF(, initially consisting of 306 national indicators)version 1.0 (along with identified data sources and periodicity in consultation with concerned Ministries/Departments, UN Agencies and other stakeholders.

The union Cabinet, in its meeting held on 24.10.2018, approved the proposal of the Ministry on NIF for SDGs on constitution of High Level Steering Committee (HLSC) to periodically review and refine the NIF. Accordingly, the HLSC under the Chairmanship of Chief Statistician of India cum Secretary, MoSPI with members from NITI Aayog, M/o Home Affairs, M/o Health and FW, M/o Environment, Forest and Climate Change, M/o Finance and MoSPI has been constituted to periodically review, refine and modify the NIF .Thenceforth, several initiatives have been taken by the MoSPI which inter-alia include release of first Baseline report on SDG-NIF, release of SDGs Dashboard, preparation and circulation of guidelines for States/UTs for development of State Indicator Framework, Capacity Development on SDGs for Central and State officials, launching of new surveys for bridging the data gaps by collecting data on certain indicators in the next round of National Sample Surveys, alignment of existing surveys as per SDG data requirements, etc.
The NIF is evolutionary in nature and is refined from time to time in consultation with line Ministries/Custodian Agencies .At present, the latest version of the NIF)Version 3.1 (consists of 295 indicators and data is available on 266 indicators.

MoSPI has conducted several surveys, such as, the Periodic Labour Force Survey (PLFS), Time Use Surveys (TUS), Situation Assessment Survey (SAS) on

Agriculture Households Conditions etc. to come out with relevant data for a number of indicators from the NIF. The details regarding these surveys have been placed in **Annexure-I**.

With respect to initiating effective steps in order to identify the milestones for all the indicators and commence working on these indicators in right earnest, MoSPI had a meeting with NITI Aayog and thereafter the data source Ministries/Departments along with the line Ministries/Departments, responsible for implementation of respective SDGs, were requested to fix the milestones of the concerned SDG national indicators so as to monitor the progress made towards achieving the SDGs .The matter was rigorously followed with the line Ministries/Departments and 5 online workshops with concerned line Ministries/Departments were conducted so as to collectively resolve the issues relating to fixing the milestones.

While facilitating the concerned data source/implementing Ministries/Department in fixation the milestones for SDG indicators, the following challenges were faced:

i. The data source Ministries/Departments were different from the Implementing Ministries in respect of several SDG indicators because indicators were based on Survey/Census/other compiled statistics;
ii. For some of the SDG indicators, it was not feasible to set the milestones, especially budget related indicators;
iii. The data source Ministries/Departments suggested refinements in the some of the existing SDG indicators.

As per SDG NIF Progress Report 2021)Version 3.1 (released on 29th June, 2021; there are 295 indicators in the NIF and data is available for 266 indicators .With regard to these 266 national indicators for which data is available, the status on milestone setting is as under:

a. For 142 indicators either Milestones have been set or Ministries/Departments have provided inputs or have submitted that it is not feasible to set the milestones.
b. For the remaining indicators, the line Ministries/Departments have informed that they are still working with their concerned Divisions/Wings/Units or with other related Ministries (wherever applicable). MoSPI will continue to interact with the line Ministries/Departments for facilitating milestones fixing on remaining indicators.

Detailed response related to Milestone setting for SDG national Indicators is placed at **Annexure-II.**

Vetting Comments of Audit

As data for 29 out of 295 National indicators is still not available, efforts made by MoSPI may be intimated to PAC.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

MoSPI has released the Sustainable Development Goals-National Indicator Framework Progress Report 2021 (version 3.1) on 29th June 2021. At present, there are 295 indicators in National Indicator Framework (NIF), out of which data is available for 266 indicators. MoSPI has taken several steps for compiling data on the remaining 29 NIF indicators which inter-alia include conduct of a Multiple Indicator Survey (MIS) during 78th Round of National Sample Survey (NSS). Further, MoSPI is all set to launch a Comprehensive Annual Modular Survey (CAMS) as part of NSS 79th round to capture and compile data on some of the SDG indicators. Apart from this, MoSPI is rigorously pursuing with respective subject matter Ministries of the Government of India for getting data for remaining indicators.

Observation/Recommendation No. 12

Goal 3-Good Health and Well Being

The Committee note that the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare is responsible for Goal-3 of SDGs i.e. "Good health and well being" which is intended to ensure healthy living and promote well-being of people of all ages. To monitor SDG-3, a list of 73 Health related indicators have been identified by MoSPI and communicated in the Health Indicator Framework (HIF). These include, 'mortality' as also other indicators which have an impact on health. As per the National Indicator Framework (NIF) prepared by MoSPI, the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare is to serve as the data source agency for 44 indicators (which is a subset of above mentioned 73 HIF indicators). Further, as for the remaining indicators which have an impact on health, the major data sources are the office of Registrar General of India (ORGI), Department of Drinking Water and Sanitation under Ministry of Jal Shakti, National Crime Record Bureau (NCRB), Ministry of Environment, Forests and Climate change etc.

The Committee note that the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare are optimistic of the country achieving the following targets as per the timelines indicated:

MMR, released by the SRS (ORGI), has declined to 122 per 1 lakh live births during 2015-17 from 130 during 2014-16. If India continues to maintain the present percent change (-6.2%) annually, the country is expected to achieve the MMR target of 70 by the year 2025.

U5MR has declined from 39 per 1000 live births in 2016 to 37 per 1000 live births in 2017 (as per SRS report). India is expected to achieve SDG target well before by the year 2020-21 if the past trend is continued.

NNMR has declined to 23 per 1000 live births as per SRS, 2017. India is expected to achieve the SDG targets of 12 by the year 2025 if the past trend is continued.

The Committee trust that the goals would be within reach despite the challenges posed by the ongoing pandemic, for tackling which a significant amount of resources are being utilized. The Committee would like to know the present status of achievement of the said targets and steps taken to achieve the same within the stipulated time.

(Sl. No. 12; Appendix II; Para No.12 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

The present status of achievement of the said target is as follows:

- MMR, released by the SRS (ORGI), has declined to 113 per 1 lakh live during 2016-18 from 122 per lakh during 2015-17. The State-wise data is given at **Annexure III**.
- U5MR has declined from 37 per 1000 live births in 2017 to 36 per 1000 live births in 2018 (as per SRS report). The State-wise data is given at **Annexure IV**.
- NNMR is 23 per 1000 live births as per SRS, 2018. The State-wise data is given at **Annexure V**.

National Health Mission represents an important vehicle to achieve the SDGs. While it is clear that it would take at least a decade or more for India to provide Universal Health Coverage (UHC) to all her citizens, implementation of the NHM for the next

five years, will build on the steps already taken. The Health System Strategies (HSS) under NHM, focused on improving quality of facility-based delivery, strengthening the district hospitals, expanding and improving outreach services, provision of free medical consultation, diagnostics, essential medicines and referral transport and capacity building and skilling of human resources, are the building blocks for progress towards the achievement of SDG.

Further, the specific interventions mapped against the said targets are:

Target: To reduce MMR to less than 70 per 1,00,000 live births

Programme Interventions:

- JananiSurakshaYojana (JSY), JananiShishuSurakshaKaryakaram (JSSK), SurakshitMatritvaAashwasan (SUMAN),
- PradhanMantriSurakshitMatritvaAbhiyan (PMSMA), Anemia Mukt Bharat (AMB), Labour Room & Quality Improvement Initiative (LaQshya),
- Midwifery Initiative,
- Emergency obstetric and newborn care (EmONC), Basic Emergency obstetric and newborn care (BEmONC),
- Skill Birth Attendant (SBA), and Dakshata
- Strengthening FRU delivery points,
- MCH Wings, Skill Labs,
- Setting up of Obs. HDU/ICU, Comprehensive Abortion care (CAC), Maternal Death Surveillance & Response (MDSR).

Target: End preventable deaths of new-borns and children under 5 years of age

Programme Interventions:

- Facility Based Newborn Care (FBNC), Home Based Newborn Care (HBNC), Home Based care of Young Child (HBYC),Nutrition Rehabilitation Centre (NRC),
- Comprehensive Lactation Management Centre (CLMC), Anemia Mukt Bharat (AMB), National Deworming Day (NDD),
- Intensive Diarrhoea Control Fortnight (IDCF), Social Awareness and Actions to Neutralize Pneumonia Successfully (SAANS), RashtriyaBalSwasthyaKaryakram (RBSK),
- Child Death Review (CDR).

Vetting Comments of Audit

No comments.

Observation/Recommendation No. 13

Consultative Process-Ministryof Health and Family Welfare

The Committee note that the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare have organized consultations on transitioning from MDGs to SDGs and also held a State Level Conference on Goal 3. However, three Ministries/Departments, namely, AYUSH, Tribal Affairs and Home Affairs that are associated with Goal 3 of the SDGs have not been involved in such consultations; and it was only after the matter was pointed out by the Audit as well as the Committee that the representatives of these Ministries were included in the National Task Force. The Committee also note with dismay that specific and sustained measures for promoting awareness and stakeholder involvement in regard to Goal-3 have not been seen in the States. The Committee have been informed in this regard that besides regular meetings that are held with related Ministries as also the National Task Force and Working Groups, Joint video conferences with the

related Ministries are used as a means for enhancing stakeholder engagement and raising awareness. Expanding the scope of public awareness from boardrooms to the ground level SDGs may not be easy to achieve. The Committee, therefore, desire that besides the meetings of Ministries concerned and the Task Force, Members of Parliament, MLAs, Chairman, ZilaPanchayat, District Health officer, Officers at the Block level etc. may also be associated with the task of raising awareness and thereby enable in effective participation in achievement of SDGs.

(Sl. No. 13; Appendix II; Para No.13 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

The observation is noted.

Vetting Comments of Audit

As per direction of PAC, the replies should be comprehensive and not inconclusive, vague, or couched in general terms like 'Noted' or 'accepted' etc. Hence, details of specific steps taken in compliance to PAC's observation may be elucidated.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

The National Health Programmes mapped against the targets and indicators to achieve SDG-3 Goal are supported under National Health Mission for including Information, Education and Communication (IEC), and awareness activities. The programme specific activities which are organised by States/UTs involve stakeholders ranging from grassroots level to Zila Panchayat, District Health officer, Officers at the Block level, etc.

Besides coordinating, the IEC and awareness activities at the Programme Division level, the Swasth Nagrik Abhiyaan (SNA) division of the Ministry executes comprehensive IEC activities and provision of awareness on various National Health Programmes from time to time so that the slated objectives under the programmes are eventually achieved, which will lead the country to achieve SDG-3 targets.

Observation/Recommendation No. 14

Monitoring by Ministry of Health & Family Welfare

The Committee note that the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare specifically aligned different interventions/initiatives/schemes and targets with Goal 3 in the 2017-2020 phase of NHM. It was, however, noted that mapping in respect of Goal 3 was not comprehensive in the selected States and several State sponsored Health Schemes were also not mapped with Goal 3. The Committee, in this regard, are of the view that cases of gaps could have been filled if proper Audit of all the States/UTs had been done. As informed to the Committee, mapping in the States has been reinforced as a result of the meeting of the Working Group on the rollout of SDG-3 in States/UTs that was held on 28 January, 2020. Mapping in respect of Goal 3 will be facilitated by way of ensuring regular support and monitoring and Ministry of Health & Family Welfare is proactively working with all States for helping them to complete the exercise of mapping. As per the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, States are constitutionally mandated to deliver on most of the socio-economic sectors that constitute the SDGs. Yet, the Committee are of the view that primarily on account of the fact that the Country is committed to achieving certain specific goals, the aspect of monitoring and providing support to the States would ideally rest with the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and other relevant Ministries concerned. Therefore, the Committee recommend that the

Ministry of Health & Family Welfare should develop an effective mechanism for monitoring the various programmes/schemes at the Block, District and State level so as to enable in achieving the target of mapping by all the States. The Committee would also emphasise on continuing with persuading and understanding the problems faced by the States and the implementing agencies at the ground level so that the goals envisaged can be achieved.

(Sl. No. 14; Appendix II; Para No.14 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

A web based online dashboard (i.e. SDG Health Dashboard) has been developed under the guidance of DoHFW with technical and financial support from WHO. This is an interactive dashboard which provides a visual representation of all-India and state-wise performance for various health indicators and thus enables Policy makers/Program implementers, to identify priorities for action and in framing future action plan towards achieving SDG goals by 2030.
The SDG Health Dashboard has in-built business intelligence tools to correlate the Goal with Indicators to exhibit, through graphic presentation of charts, graphs and maps, the indicator values, their trend and enable tracking the performances, at national and sub-national levels, towards achieving the SDG-3 Health Goal.

The SDG Health Dashboard was launched on Universal Health Coverage Day on 12th December 2020 and the States have been oriented and are encouraged to develop their own SDG Health Dashboard in the same line.

Vetting Comments of Audit

No Comments.

Observation/Recommendation No. 15

Integration of Policy Framework

From the information furnished, the Committee note that the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare has initiated several measures that arc supportive of achieving horizontal and vertical policy coherence. However coherent policy initiatives have either been absent or inadequate in the States. As per the submission of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, however, there is adequate policy coherence between the Centre and the State Governments. The Committee find this contention of the Ministry to be untenable, as in all the seven States, the Centre and the States have not been playing their respective roles effectively in a collaborative manner for achieving the intended outcomes. The Committee also feel anguished to note that with regard to the aspect of vertical coherence, a working group set up by the M/o H&FW for implementing Goal 3 in the States and UTs has not held any meeting. It was only after the issue was pointed out by the Committee in their sitting on 23 January, 2020, that the Working Group of the National Task Force held a meeting on 28 January, 2020. It has also been informed by the Ministry that the National Task Force reiterated the need for conducting regular meetings of the working groups and that necessary instructions have been communicated to all the officials concerned. The Committee are of the view in this regard that mere issue of instructions would not produce the desired results unless these are complied with both in letter and spirit. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the meetings of the Working Groups be held at regular intervals so as to suggest ways and means to achieve vertical as well as horizontal coherence on policy measures between the Centre and the State Governments. The Committee would also desire to be apprised of the sittings

of working groups held so far, the steps suggested by them to maintain policy coherence and the action taken by the Centre/States thereon.

(Sl. No. 15; Appendix II; Para No.15 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

The first meeting of the working group on the roll out of SDG-3 in States/UTs was held on 28th January 2020. Mapping of the SDG indicators was emphasised during the meeting. The working group suggested that the State/UTs are to be encouraged in developing their own State Indicator Framework (SIFs), in sync with the National Indicator Framework. Subsequently, due to the ongoing pandemic situation the meeting could not be convened.

Vetting Comments of Audit

The Committee may be informed whether the possibility of virtual meetings have been explored for holding such meetings.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

The subsequent meetings planned will also have the option of virtual participation.

Observation/Recommendation No. 16

Public Health Expenditure

The Committee note that NHM envisages to increase the Public Health expenditure from around one percent (2015-16) to 2.5 percent of GDP (at current price by 2025). As per the Audit observation, however, though Public Health Expenditure as a percentage of GDP has been increasing since 2015-16, it has remained within a narrow band of 1.02 lo 1.28 per cent of GDP. The Committee also find that the National Health Mission was being allocated comparatively less funds during the years 2017-18 and 2018-19. Inadequate allocations may hinder achieving the laudable targets set. Considering the need to achieve the SDGs in health sector, the Committee recommend that there should not be any inadequacy of funds that may hamper in reaching the target level of achievement of Goal-3. Additionally, the Centre as well as the States should make proper assessment of their financial requirements and availability of financial resources for the implementation of Goal-3. Further, steps also need to be taken to ingrate SDGs into the accounting and budgeting framework both at the Centre and the States. The Committee are also unhappy to note that though the NHP prescribed increasing States health spending, records of seven selected States reveal that the allocation for health care has been inadequate. Although several steps are stated to have been taken to nudge the States to augment health spending, the Committee are of the considered view that the expenditure on health must receive earnest consideration and priority.

(Sl. No. 16; Appendix II; Para No.16 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

The Ministry of Health and Family Welfare has provided no response.

Vetting Comments of Audit

PAC may take a suitable view that Ministry of Health and Family Welfare has not furnished any reply.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

As per the National Health Account Estimates, out-of-pocket expenditure (OOPE) as a percentage of current health expenditure (CHE) has declined by 5.9 percentage points from 69.1 per cent in 2013-14 to 63.2 per cent in 2016-17. This implies that financial protection to households for healthcare has improved over this period.

Central Government has taken several initiatives for supplementing the efforts and availability of financial resources for the implementation of Goal-3 by providing quality and affordable healthcare services to the people. Some of the major initiatives include National Health Mission, Ayushman Bharat (AB)-Health & Wellness Centres (HWCs), PradhanMantri Jan ArogyaYojana (PMJAY), PradhanMantriSwasthyaSurakshaYojana (PMSSY) and upgradation of medical colleges. This Ministry has supported the efforts of the States/UTs under India COVID-19 Emergency Response and Health System Preparedness Package-I and II for the management of COIVD-19 pandemic and strengthening of the healthcare infrastructure.

The other major initiative, announced in the current year budget (2021-22) is PradhanMantriAtmaNirbhar Bharat Yojana (PM-ASBY), a new Centrally Sponsored Scheme, with an outlay of about Rs. 64,180 Crores. This will develop capacities of primary, secondary, tertiary care Health Systems, strengthen existing national institutions, and create new institutions to cater to detection and cure of new and emerging diseases. This will be in addition to the National Health Mission.

Further, it is ensured that State Health Budget is increased by at-least 10 per cent over last year. Where such increase over last year is less than 10 per cent, then the average of last 3 years is considered as a conditionality for release of 2nd instalment of funds to the States/UTs with the objective of encouraging States to make higher allocations to health from their own budgetary resources.

Observation/Recommendation No. 17

Adequacy of Public Health Care Facilities

The Committee are concerned to find that despite the prevalence of Plans/Policies as well as increase in allocations for augmenting Physical and human resources, significant shortages continue to persist in regard to the physical resources in all seven States. As for human resources, there were considerable shortages in the States of Chhattisgarh and Uttar Pradesh. The Committee, in this regard are not in agreement with the plea taken by the MoH&FW that Public Health and Hospitals is a State subject and the primary responsibility of strengthening the healthcare delivery systems lies with the respective States. This argument does not absolve the Ministry from the responsibility of being the nodal Ministry in the health sector, which can create the intended healthcare facilities across the country. The Committee are of the considered view that the primary responsibility for attaining Goal-3 in an efficacious manner within the given timeframe lies with the MoHFW. Further, in regard to the large difference between the PHCs required as per population norms and PHCs actually functioning in the selected States, the Committee have been apprised that under Ayushman Bharat Scheme, it is envisaged to transform 1.5 lakh Sub Health Centres (SHCs), Primary Health Centres (PHCs) and Urban Primary Health Centres (UPHCS) into Health and Wellness Centres (AB-HWCs) by December, 2022. These centres are proposed to be headed by a

new cadre of Community Health Officers (CHOs) who would be B.Sc. Nursing Graduates or Ayurvedic Practitioners trained in six-month course in certificate programme for core competencies in Public Health and Primary Health Care. The Committee in this regard feel that it would be advisable to post at least one MBBS Doctor in these Wellness centres as para-medical personnel cannot prescribe medicines to the patients. Effective utilisation of the services of MBBS Doctors in the health care delivery system of India right from Wellness Centres, can possibly make a big difference in achieving the SD Goals. The Committee are also of the view that to prevent doctors from going abroad, suitable facilities and encouragement may be given to them to serve the people in the country. The Committee, therefore desire that with a view to improving health services in remote areas, at least one Allopathic doctor along with paramedical staff should be posted in each Wellness Centre. The Committee feel that there is also an imperative need to constantly monitor the functioning of Wellness Centres at regular intervals besides ensuring regular attendance of Doctors there so that the goal of providing affordable, effective and reliable health care, especially for the poor In the rural areas is achieved.

(Sl. No. 17; Appendix II; Para No.17 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

As per the operational guidelines of AYUSHMAN BHARAT – Comprehensive Primary Health Care through health and wellness Centres - The services envisaged at the Health and Wellness Centres (HWC) level include early identification, basic management, counselling, ensuring treatment adherence, follow up care, ensuing continuity of care by appropriate referrals, optimal home and community follow up, and health promotion and prevention for the expanded range of services. The primary health care teams at the SHCs led by the Community Health Officers (CHO) are trained to provide first level of management and triage, i.e. refer the patient to the appropriate health facility for treatment and follow up. The Medical Officer (MBBS) at the PHCs/UPHCs would be responsible for ensuring that Comprehensive Primary Health Care services are delivered through all SHCs-HWCs in her/his area. Further, teleconsultations are done by the CHOs at SHCs with Medical Officers (MO) at PHC level or MO at State/District level Hubs and subsequently medicines are dispensed by the CHO based on the prescriptions of these MO. Similarly, specialist teleconsultations services are being provided between MO at PHC and specialist at State/District level Hubs. As on 11th August 2021, 91.66 Lakhs such teleconsultation services (e-sanjeevani HWC consultations - 46.11 lakhs and e-sanjeevani OPD consultations – 45.5 Lakhs) have been provided.

Vetting Comments of Audit

Ministry has not furnished details on the following recommendations of PAC:

(i) Steps taken to post at least one Allopathic doctor along with paramedical staff in each wellness Centre to improve health services in remote areas, and

(ii) Steps taken to constantly monitor the functioning of Wellness Centres at regular intervals besides ensuring regular attendance of doctors.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

(i) Under Ayushman Bharat – Health and Wellness Centres (AB-HWCs), as on 22.09.2021, there are 21,290 PHC-HWCs (Rural Primary Health Centre) and 4,135 UPHC-HWCs (Urban Primary Health Centre) are functional where at-least one MBBS (Allopathic) Doctors are posted to cater to the healthcare needs.

(ii) To monitor the functioning of the HWCs following measure are taken.

a) Constant monitoring on the implementation of CPHC services closer to the population through HWCs, happen through regular review meetings & Video conferences to provide required technical handholding and financial support.

b) This regular review and monitoring have enabled the achievement of FY 2020-21 target of 70,000 HWCs, well ahead of time by converting the existing SHCs, PHCs and UPHCs into HWCs. The State/UTs were able to operationalise 74,947 against the target of 70,000 HWCs by 31st March 2021.

c) Regional review conferences are organised regularly from FY 2018-19, clustering with group of State/UTs to review the implementation challenges.

d) The performance of State in operationalisation of HWCs is documented regularly and placed in public domain (http://117.239.180.230/hwc/live_application/hwc/home /new_releases).

e) Further, under Incentive conditionality under NHM Framework from FY 2020-21 has an indicator for achieving the target for operationalisation of HWCs.

f) Moreover, third-party evaluation of HWCs in 18 is undertaken for the performance of HWCs in FY 2019-20 and FY 2021-21 and the report will be released soon.

g) NITI Aayog also suggested that 2% of functional HWCs are to be evaluated independently by Third party.

Observation/Recommendation No. 18

Data on Health Parameters

The Committee observe that both at the Central and State levels, there is evidence of insufficient efforts at putting in place a comprehensive indicator framework, identification of data sources, and production of disaggregated data for Goal 3 which are essential for creating a robust monitoring and reporting framework. The Committee are also astonished to find that for some important indicators such as Maternal Mortality Rate, Under-five Child Mortality Rate and Neonatal Mortality Rate, data was not uniformly or regularly available. The Committee are constrained to observe in this regard that the absence of relevant data would obviously hamper the Ministry in monitoring such cases and combating the same. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the M/o H&FW needs to collect and collate authentic data on various health parameters. The database so compiled also needs to be digitalized and constantly updated so as to enable in taking effective steps for addressing issues relating to mortality rates. The Committee further find that in the National Indicator Framework (NIF) the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare was assigned the responsibility of maintaining and supplying information on 44 NIF health related indicators. The Committee have been apprised that the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare has provided SDG baseline data in respect of 42 out of the assigned 44 Health indicators. For two indicators i.e. viral Hepatitis (including A&B) and number of deaths due to cancer, robust datasets were not available. Presently, however, Hepatitis has been included in the National Family Health Surveys (NFHS), and the possibility of having authentic data on deaths due to cancer is being explored. The Committee note that substantial efforts are being made for putting in place a comprehensive indicator framework, identification of data sources and production of disaggregated data for SDG Goal 3. The Committee would like to be apprised of the details of the indicators that have actually been mapped and those that remain to be mapped following the validation by the C&AG establishment.

(Sl. No. 18; Appendix II; Para No.18 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

As produced in the page No. 51 of the 32nd Report of 17th Lok Sabha on Preparedness for the Implementation of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), out of the 44 indicators assigned to MoHFW, all the indictors have been mapped except the indicator 3.4.1, i.e. Number of deaths due to cancer. The details of the rest of the indicators are attached at **Annexure -VI**.

Vetting Comments of Audit

Though the details of the indicators except one has been provided, it is not clear whether the third column titled "India" in **Annexure-VI** provides the baseline data figure or the present data status or the target of the concerned indicator. This may be explained to PAC.

ATN with respect to Vetting Comments

The third column titled 'India' in **Annexure-VI** provides latest data available as per the data source given. The legends in the table are corrected.

Observation/Recommendation No. 19

Addressing the shortcomings highlighted

For addressing the deficiencies in regard to Goal 3 of SDGs, as highlighted, the Committee feel that the best practices for achieving the SDGs as followed by various States should be studied in depth by the M/oH&FW and wherever feasible, replicated in the States where deficiencies are noticed. The Committee also recommend that the Ministry should also conduct a study of the best healthcare systems prevailing in other countries - both developed and developing, so that the health schemes could be restructured accordingly to make the achievement of Sustainable Development goals a grand success. In particular, the Ministry should study the Cuba model, which is considered to be one of the best health care system in the world.

(Sl. No. 19; Appendix II; Para No.19 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

Under the Innovation summit of NHM an additional category for best practices for implementation of State Specific intervention towards achievement of SDGs will be included. Further, the Ministry also will study the Cuba model of health care system to learn the good practices.

Vetting Comments of Audit

Conclusive action is yet to be taken on PAC's recommendation.

Observation/Recommendation No. 20

Corrective steps for timely achievement of SDGs

The Committee have noticed several deficiencies/shortcomings in achieving the Sustainable Development Goals in India. The facts stated in the foregoing Paragraphs clearly identified certain shortfalls in each area, which require

immediate attention and remedial action. Both at the Central and State levels, the exercise of formulating policy documents in the context of SDGs is still underway. A roadmap with defined milestones aligned with UN SDG Targets Is yet to be prepared. Greater efforts also appear to be necessary for localising and publicising the SDGs to ensure inclusiveness. With respect to resource mobilisation for achieving the SDG targets, a financial gap analysis has not yet been undertaken. Further, integration of SDGs into the accounting and budgeting framework remains to be done at the Centre and in most States. With respect to Monitoring and Reporting, the delay in publication of the National Indicator Framework (NIF) had held back several key tasks such as development of indicators and monitoring frameworks in the States and identification of baseline data and milestones. The Committee express serious concern over the facts narrated above and desire that in the light of the committee's suggestions, the NITI Aayog and Ministries/Departments concerned should take adequate/corrective steps with a view to effectively achieving all the Sustainable Development Goals within a prescribed time limit. The Committee also feel that there is a need for scrutiny in other sectors as well.

(Sl. No.20; Appendix II; Para No.20 of the Thirty-Second Report of the Public Accounts Committee) (17th LokSabha)

Action Taken

As stated above, NITI Aayog continues to take forward the SDG Agenda in respect of responsibilities allocated and strive to help improve implementation and performance. NITI Aayog carries forward the national coordination of the implementation of SDGs in collaboration with Central Ministries as well as States and UTs. It works with the States and UTs for greater localisation of SDGs, which includes major initiatives on developing State and District level indicators, improving the institutional system for SDG implementation and monitoring, building capacities at various levels and strengthening partnerships with other stakeholders, such as, the civil society, private sector, etc. NITI Aayog is publishing the SDG India Index (3 editions already published) to track progress on SDGs both at national and State/UT levels, which has become a globally recognised effective and catalytic tool to drive performance at all levels. The Index has been sought to be further localised – the first Regional District SDG Index for the North Eastern Region has been developed and launched on 26 August 2021 in partnership with the Ministry of Development of the North Eastern Region.

In view of the responsibility assigned, MoSPI developed an NIF for SDGs, and in compliance to Cabinet decision, an HLSC on SDGs under the Chairmanship of Chief Statistician of India cum Secretary, MoSPI with members from NITI Aayog, Ministries of Home Affairs; Health and Family Welfare; Environment, Forest and Climate Change; Finance and MoSPI, has been constituted to periodically review, refine and modify the NIF. Accordingly, MoSPI, in consultation with line Ministries/Departments and Custodian Agencies, examines the suitability of existing indicators as well as new indicators for the relevant target(s) and periodically reviews and refines the NIF.

Further, several initiatives have been taken by the MoSPI which inter-alia include release of first Baseline report on SDG-NIF, release of SDGs Dashboard, preparation and circulation of guidelines for States/UTs for development of State Indicator Framework, Capacity Development on SDGs for the Central and the State officials, launching of new surveys for bridging the data gaps by collecting data on certain indicators in the next round of National Sample Surveys, alignment of existing surveys as per SDG data requirements etc.

Vetting Comments of Audit

No comments.

Annexure I

Details of surveys conducted by MoSPI

S.N.	Survey	Year /Survey period	Status as on 16.08.2021
1	**Periodic Labour Force Survey(PLFS):** The major key parameters of labour force estimated through the PLFS are Labour Force Participation Rate)LFPR(, Worker Population Ratio)WPR(, and Unemployment Rate)UR.(	Initiated in 2017	Three annual reports have been released as on date for the period: July, 2017-June, 2018, July, 2018 -June, 2019, and July, 2019 -June, 2020 Eight Quarterly bulletins for the urban sector till the quarter ending September, 2020 have been released viz .for the following periods: Oct-.Dec., 2018 Jan-.March, 2019; April-June, 2019 July-Sept., 2019; Oct-.Dec., 2019 Jan-.March, 2020; April-June, 2020, July-Sept., 2020
2	**Time Use Survey)TUS:(** The primary objective of TUS is to measure participation of men, women and other groups of persons in paid and unpaid activities	Initiated in 2019	TUS is to be conducted once in three years .The first TUS survey was conducted in 2019 and the result of the survey has been released in September, 2020.
3	**NSS 77th round:** **(i) Land and Livestock holdings,** (ii) **Debt & Investment,** (iii) **Situation Assessment of Agricultural Households:** The Surveys are aimed at studying different indicators and operational holdings of rural households including their ownership of livestock and various estimates related to the situation of agricultural household; Whereas the **Survey on Debt and Investment** aimed to study)i (demand for credit from rural families and)ii (the supply of credit by credit agencies both institutions and non-institutions;	January–December 2019	Reports are in final stages and expected to be released soon.

**Note :All the survey reports except the reports of NSS 77th round are available on the website of the Ministry at www.mospi.gov.in.*

Annexure-II

Thirty-SecondReport(17thLokSabha)ofthePublicAccountsCommittee(2020-2021)on"PreparednessfortheImplementationofSustainableDevelopmentGoals(SDGs)"basedonC&AGReportNo.8of2019

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
1	2.4.2:PercentageoffarmersissuedSoilHealthCard	INM,DAC&FW, MinistryofAgricultureandFarmers'Welfare	Annual	MinistryofAgricultureandFarmers'Welfare	20%	40%	60%	90%	
2	2.4.3:Percentageofnetareaunderorganicfarming	INM,DAC&FW, MinistryofAgricultureandFarmers'Welfare	Annual		3.15	4.16	5.5	8.37	
3	2.5.1(a):Numberofplantresourcesforfoodandagriculturesecuredineithermedium-orlong-termconservationfacilities(innumber)	MinistryofAgricultureandFarmers'Welfare,DARE,NationalBureauofPlantGeneticResources,(ICAR-NBPGR)	Annual		4.6Lakh	4.7Lakhs		4.95Lakh	
4	2.5.1(b):animalgeneticresourcesforfoodandagriculturesecuredineithermedium-orlong-termconservationfacilities	MinistryofAgricultureandFarmers'Welfare,DARE, NationalBureauofAnimalGeneticResources,(ICAR-NBAGR)	Annual		Numberofsemendose:267000; Numberofsomaticcellvials:5400	Numberofsemendose: 302000; Numberofsomaticcellvials:7400	Numberofsemendose: 342000; Numberofsomaticcellvials:9800	Numberofsemendose: 397000; Numberofsomaticcellvials:12600	
5	5.a.1:Operationallandholdings-(femaleoperatedoperationalholding)	AgricultureCensus,DAC&FW,MinistryofAgricultureandFarmers'Welfare	5years			22922 (in'000 hectare)		32179 (in'000 hectare)	
6	1.5.1:Numberofdeaths,missingpersonsanddirectlyaffectedpersonsattributedtodisastersper100,000population(similartoIndicator11.5.1and13.1.1)	DisasterManagementDivision,MinistryofHomeAffairs	Annual	MinistryofHomeAffairs(DisasterManagementDivision)	DMDhassubmittedthatitwouldnotbeappropriatetofixmilestonefortheindicatorasthenumberofdeath,missingpersonsetc.arehighlyunpredictable				
7	1.5.3:Whetherthecountryhasadoptedandimplementednationaldisasterriskreductionstrategiesinlinewiththe SendaiFrameworkforDisasterRiskReduction2015-2030,(similartoIndicator11.b.1and13.1.2)	DisasterManagementDivision,MinistryofHomeAffairs	Annual		Achievedin2019.				

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
8	1.5.4:Proportionoflocalgovernmentsthatadoptandimplementlocaldisasterriskreductionstrategiesinlinewithnationaldisasterriskreductionstrategies,(similartoIndicator 11.b.2and13.1.3)	DisasterManagementDivision,MinistryofHomeAffairs	Annual		By2023,alldistrictsinStates/UTsshallpreparetheirDisasterManagementPlans.				
9	11.5.1:Numberofdeaths,missingpersons anddirectlyaffectedpersonsattributedtodisastersper100,000population(similartoIndicator1.5.1and13.1.1)	DisasterManagement Division,MinistryofHomeAffairs	Annual		DMDhassubmittedthatitwouldnotbeappropriatetofixmilestonefortheindicatorasthenumberofdeath,missingpersonsetc.arehighlyunpredictable				
10	11.b.1:Whetherthecountryhasadoptedandimplementednationaldisasterriskreductionstrategiesinlinewiththe SendaiFrameworkforDisasterRiskReduction2015-2030(similartoIndicator11.b.1and13.1.2)	DisasterManagementDivision,MinistryofHomeAffairs	Annual		Achievedin2019.				
11	11.b.2:Proportionoflocalgovernmentsthatadoptandimplementlocaldisasterriskreductionstrategiesinlinewithnationaldisasterriskreductionstrategies,(similartoIndicator1.5.4and13.1.3)	DisasterManagementDivision,MinistryofHomeAffairs	Annual		By2023,alldistrictsinStates/UTsshallpreparetheirDisasterManagementPlans.				
12	13.1.1:Numberofdeaths,missingpersons anddirectlyaffectedpersonsattributedtodisastersper100,000population(similartoIndicator1.5.1and11.5.1)	DisasterManagementDivision,MinistryofHomeAffairs	Annual		DMDhassubmittedthatitwouldnotbeappropriatetofixmilestonefortheindicatorasthenumberofdeath,missingpersonsetc.arehighlyunpredictable				
13	13.1.2:Whetherthecountryhasadoptedandimplementednationaldisasterriskreductionstrategiesinlinewiththe SendaiFrameworkforDisasterRiskReduction2015-2030,(similartoIndicator1.5.3and11.b.1)	DisasterManagementDivision,MinistryofHomeAffairs	Annual		Achievedin2019.				

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
14	13.1.3:Proportionoflocalgovernmentsthatadoptandimplementlocaldisasterriskreductionstrategiesinlinewithnationaldisasterriskreductionstrategies,(similartoIndicator 1.5.4and11.b.2)	DisasterManagementDivision,MinistryofHomeAffairs	Annual		**By2023,alldistrictsinStates/UTsshallpreparetheirDisasterManagementPlans.**				
15	16.9.1:Percentageofbirthsregistered	OfficeoftheRegistrarGeneral,India,MinistryofHomeAffairs	Annual	MinistryofHomeAffairs(OfficeoftheRegistrarGeneral,India)	ORGIinformedthatasperORGIVision-2024-underCivilRegistrationSystem(CRS)100%registrationofbirthwouldbeachievedby2024				
16	7.1.2:Percentageofhouseholdusingcleancookingfuel	MinistryofPetroleumandNaturalGas	Annual	MinistryofPetroleumandNaturalGas	MinistryofPetroleum&NGhastargeted100%LPGcoveragefBeneficiaryhouseholdstobeachievedbyMarch2022.				
17	8.4.2:Percapitafossilfuelconsumption,(inKg.)	MinistryofPetroleumandNaturalGas	Annual		Baseline (MMT):247.7, PCC(kg): 154.4; Transition(MMT):242.7, PCC(kg): 167.3;Transformation (MMT):238.3, PCC(kg): 164.3	Baseline (MMT):273.0,PCC (kg): 182.8; Transition(MMT):264.0,PCC (kg): 176.7;Transformation (MMT):256.0,PCC (kg):171.4	Baseline (MMT):291.3,PCC (kg): 189.5; Transition(MMT):279.3 PCC(kg): 181.7;Transformation (MMT):266.5,PCC (kg):173.4	Baseline (MMT):321.0,PCC (kg): 200.4; Transition (MMT):304.0,PCC (kg): 189.8;Transformation (MMT):283.0,PCC (kg): 176.7	**Baselinescenario**referstothe conservativecasewhenwetakethe existingfactorstogrowonsimilar linesinpast&present. **TransitionScenario**offersa perspectivewherefavourable Governmentpolicies,plausible technologicalbreakthroughsandsocio-economicdriversactasimpetus towardsmeetingthegrowingenergy demandsofIndia. **TransformationScenario**offersan optimisticperspectivewhereincertain sectorspecificdriversprovideathrust todomesticenergydemand
18	5.5.1:ProportionofseatsheldbywomeninnationalParliament,StateLegislationandLocalSelfGovernment(similartoIndicators 10.2.2and16.7.1)	**(1) ElectionCommissionofIndia** (2) RajyaSabhaSecretariat(3)MinistryofPanchayatiRaj	5yearsforLokSabhaandPRI;2YearsforRajyaSabha	(1)ElectionCommissionofIndia(2)RajyaSabhaSecretariat(3)MinistryofPanchayatiRaj	Itisnotfeasibletofixmilestonefortheindicator.				

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
19	10.2.2:Proportionofseatsheldbywomeninn ationalParliament,StateLegislationandLoc alSelfGovernment,(similartoIndicators5.5. 1and16.7.1)	(1) ElectionCommissio nofIndia (2) RajyaSabhaS ecretariat(3)Ministr yofPanchayatiRaj	5yearsforLokSab ha&PRI;2Yearsfor RajyaSabha		Itisnotfeasibletofixmilestonefortheindicator.				
20	16.7.1:Proportionofseatsheldbywomeninn ationalParliament,StateLegislationandLoc alSelfGovernment(similartoIndicators5.5.1 and10.2.2)	(1) ElectionCommissio nofIndia (2) RajyaSabhaS ecretariat(3)Ministr yofPanchayatiRaj	5YearsforLokSab ha&PRI;2Yearsfo rRajyaSabha		Itisnotfeasibletofixmilestonefortheindicator.				
21	5.5.3:Numberofwomencandidatesoutoftot alcandidatescontestingelections(inpercent age)	ElectionCommissionofI ndia	5Years	ElectionCommissionofIndi a	ECIhasinformedthatfixingmilestonesfortheseindicatorsisb eyondthepurviewofECI.				
22	10.2.3:ProportionofSC/STpersonsin Electedbodies,(LokSabha)(similarto 16.7.2)	ElectionCommissionofI ndia	5Years						
23	16.7.2:ProportionofSC/STpersonsintheel ectedbodies(LokSabha)(similartoindicato r10.2.3)	ElectionCommissionofI ndia	5Years						
24	8.2.2:Totalnumberofpatentsissued(granted),(similartoIndicator8.3.2and 9.5.3)	DepartmentforPr omotionof IndustryandInternalTrad e(DPIIT),Ministryof CommerceandIn dustry	Annual	MinistryofCommerceandIndust ry	32800	36200	40000	46200	
25	8.3.2:Totalnumberofpatentsissued(granted)(similartoindicators8.2.2and 9.5.3)	DepartmentforPr omotionof IndustryandInternalTrad e(DPIIT),Ministryof CommerceandIn dustry	Annual		32800	36200	40000	46200	

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
26	9.5.3:Totalnumberofpatentsissued(granted),(similartoIndicator8.2.2and 8.3.2)	DepartmentforPromotionof IndustryandInternalTrade(DPIIT),MinistryofCommerceandIndustry	Annual		32800	36200	40000	46200	
27	17.11.1:ShareofIndia'sexportsinGlobalexports,(inpercentage)	DGFT,MinistryofCommerce&Industry	Annual		Merchandiseexports:2to2.5%and serviceexport:4%by2030				
28	1.4.2:Numberoftelephonesubscriptionsas percentageoftotalpopulation	DepartmentofTelecommunications,MinistryofCommunications	Annual	MinistryofCommunications,DepartmentofTelecommunications	90.25	92.94	95.7	100	
29	9.c.1:NumberofInternetSubscriptionsaspercentageoftotalpopulation	DepartmentofTelecommunications,MinistryofCommunications	Annual		82.14	94.93	106.39	112.9	Onepersonmayhavemorethanoneinternetsubscription.
30	17.6.1:Fixedinternetbroadbandsubscriptionsper100inhabitants,byspeed	(a)Numerator-DepartmentofTelecommunications,MinistryofCommunications(b)Denominator-OfficeoftheRegistrarGeneral,India,MinistryofHomeAffairs	Annual		MinistryofCommunicationhasproposedtorefinetheindicator. Theindicatorwillberefinedinconsultationwithallconcernedstakeholdersandmilestoneswillbefixedthereafter.				
31	2.1.2:ProportionofbeneficiariescoveredunderNationalFoodSecurityAct2013	MinistryofConsumerAffairs,FoodandPublicDistribution	Annual	MinistryofConsumerAffairs, FoodandPublicDistribution	100	100	100	100	
32	12.3.2:Postharveststorageand distributionlossesofcentral/states poolstocksofwheatandrice	MinistryofConsumer Affairs,Foodand PublicDistribution	Annual		Storageloss: (-)0.15% Transitloss: 0.22%	Storage loss: (-)0.16% Transit loss: 0.21%	Storage loss: (-)0.17% Transitloss: 0.19%	Storage loss: (-)0.18% Transit loss: 0.16%	
33	5.5.2:Proportionofwomeninmanagerialpositionsincludingwomeninboard ofDirector,inlistedcompanies,(per1,000persons)	MinistryofCorporateAffairs	Annual	MinistryofCorporateAffairs	Milestonecannotbesetsincenumberofwomen Directorsisadisclosurebasedindicatorandistotallydependentontheannualdisclosermadebythecompanies.				

52

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
34	11.4.1:Totalpercapitaexpenditureonthepreservation,protectionandconservationofallculturalandnaturalheritage	MinistryofCulture	Annual	MinistryofCulture	MinistryofCulturehasinformedthatmilestonescannotbesetfortheindicatorasbudgetisapprovedbyM/oFinancetakingintoconsiderationtheresources,expenditure,trendsetc.oftheprecedingyear.				
35	14.1.1:CoastalWaterQualityIndex	MinistryofEarthSciences	Annual	MinistryofEarthSciences	MinistryofEarthScienceshasinformedthatacomprehensiveconsultationisrequiredwithMinistryofEarthSciences,MoSPI,MoEF&CCandStateGovernmentforfixingthemilestones.				
36	14.3.1:Averagemarineacidity(pH)measuredatagreedsiteofrepresentativesamplingstations	MinistryofEarthSciences	Annual		MinistryofEarthSciencesinformedthatmilestonecannotbesetfortheindicatorasthep Hinthecoastalwatersisdrivenbyanumberoffactorsincludingnaturalvariabilityandongoingclimatechange.				
37	14.a.1:Allocationofbudgetresources(BudgetEstimates)forOceanServices,Modelling,Applications,ResourcesandTechnology(OSMART)scheme,(inRs.crore)	MinistryofEarthSciences	Annual		Themilestonescannotbesetforbudgetrelatedindicator.				
38	14.c.1:Complianceofinternationallaws	MinistryofEarthSciences	Annual		**Achieved**				
39	4.1.1:Percentageofstudentsingrade3,5,8and 10achievingatleastaminimumproficiencylevel intermsofnationallydefinedlearning outcomes tobeattainedbypupilsattheendofeachof abovegrades	MinistryofEducation,DepartmentofSchoolEducationandLiteracy	Annual	MinistryofEducation	**Language** Class3: 90.29 Class5: 85.55 Class8: 82.82 **Math** Class3: 88.69 Class5: 79.81 Class8 :60.93		Class3: 100%	100%	

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
40	4.1.2:GrossIntakeRatiotothelast grade(primary,upperprimaryand secondary)	Departmentof SchoolEducationand Literacy,Ministryof Education	Annual		Class5:98% Class8:98% Class10: 82%	Class5: 98.5% Class8: 98.5% Class10: 84%	Class5: 99% Class8: 99% Class10: 86%	Class5: 100% Class8: 100% Class10: 88%	
41	4.1.3:GrossEnrolmentRatioinhighers econdaryeducation	Departmentof SchoolEducationandLite racy,MinistryofEducation	Annual		55%	60%	65%	80%	
42	4.1.4:NetEnrolmentRatioin primaryandupperprimary education	Departmentof SchoolEducationand Literacy,Ministryof Education	Annual		Primary: 93% Upper Primary: 72%	Primary: 95% Upper Primary: 75%	Primary: 97% Upper Primary: 78%	Primary: 100% Upper Primary: 100%	
43	4.1.5:AdjustedNetEnrolmentRatio inprimary,upperprimaryand secondaryeducation	Departmentof SchoolEducationand Literacy,Ministryof Education	Annual		Primary: 98% Upper Primary: 85% Secondary: 65.0%	Primary: 98.5% Upper Primary: 88% Secondary: 70%	Primary: 99% Upper Primary: 91% Secondary: 75%	100%	
44	4.1.6:Proportionofstudents enrolledinGrade1whoreaches lastgradeorprimary/upper primary/secondarylevels	Departmentof SchoolEducationand Literacy,Ministryof Education	Annual		Primary: 88% Elementary: 77% Secondary: 64%	Primary: 90% Elementary :81% Secondary: 68%	Primary: 95% Elementary: 85% Secondary: 72%	Primary: 100% Elementar y:90% Secondar y:80%	
45	4.1.7:Numberofyears(i)freeand (ii)compulsoryeducationguaranteedin legalframeworks	Departmentof SchoolEducationandLite racy,MinistryofEducation	Annual		8	8	8	8	
46	4.2.1:Grossearlychildhoodeducat ionenrolmentratio	Departmentof SchoolEducationandLite racy,MinistryofEducation	Annual		60%	70%	80%	90%	

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
47	4.2.2:Participationrateinorganizedlearningoneyearbeforeofficialprimaryentry	Departmentof SchoolEducationandLiteracy,MinistryofEducation	Annual		65%	80%	95%	100%	
48	4.5.1:GenderParityindicesforPrimary/Secondary/HigherSecondary/Tertiaryeducation	MinistryofEducation	Annual		1	1	1	1	
49	4.5.2:Enrolmentratioofchildrenwithdisabilities	Departmentof SchoolEducationandLiteracy,MinistryofEducation	Annual		Primary:1.05 UpperPrimary:1.14 Elementary:1.08 Secondary:0.71 Hr.Secondary:0.34	Primary:1.1UpperPrimary:1.16Elementary:1.13 Secondary:0.72 Hr.Secondary:0.35	Primary:1.15UpperPrimary:1.18Elementary:1.16 Secondary:0.73 Hr.Secondary:0.36	Primary:1.2UpperPrimary:1.2Elementary:1.2Secondary:0.75Hr.Secondary:0.38	
50	4.7.1:Extenttowhich(i)globalcitizenshipeducationand(ii)educationforsustainabledevelopmentaremainstreamedin (a)nationaleducationpolicies;(b)curricula; (c)teachereducation; and(d)studentassessment(SimilartoIndicators12.8.1and13.3.1)	Departmentof SchoolEducationandLiteracy,MinistryofEducation	Annual		Mainstreamedallindicatorsexcludingreligiouseducation				

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
51	4.a.1Proportionofschoolswith accessto:(a)electricity;(b) computersforpedagogical purposes;(c)adaptedinfrastructure andmaterialsforstudentswith disabilities/disabledfriendlyramp andtoilets;(d)basicdrinking water;(e)single-sexbasicsanitation facilities;and(f)basichandwashing facilities(aspertheWASHindicator definitions),(inpercentage)	Departmentof SchoolEducationand Literacy,Ministryof Education	Annual		Electricity: 88% Computers: 42% Ramp:100% Disabled friendly toilet:25% Drinking water:98% Boystoilet: 98% Girlstoilet: 98% Handwash facility:92%	Electricity: 92% Computers :45% Ramp: 100% Disabled friendly toilet:28% Drinking water: 99% Boystoilet: 99% Girlstoilet: 99% Handwash facility: 94%	Electricity: 96% Computers: 48% Ramp: 100% Disabled friendly toilet:31% Drinking water: 100% Boystoilet: 100% Girlstoilet: 100% Handwash facility: 96%	Electricity :100% Computer s:51% Ramp: 100% Disabled friendly toilet: 35% Drinking water: 100% Boys toilet: 100% Girls toilet: 100% Hand wash facility: 100%	
52	4.c.1:Proportionoftrained teachers,byeducationlevel (primary,upperprimary, elementary,secondaryandhigher secondaryeducation)	Departmentof SchoolEducationand Literacy,Ministryof Education	Annual		Primary: 90% Upper Primary: 90% Secondary: 82%	Primary: 95% Upper Primary:95 % Secondary: 84%	Primary: 100% Upper Primary:10 0% Secondary: 86%	Primary: 100% Upper Primary:1 00% Secondar y:88%	
53	6.2.3:Proportionofschoolswithseparat etoiletfacilityforgirls	Departmentof SchoolEducationandLite racy,MinistryofEducation	Annual		100	100	100	100	
54	12.8.1:Extenttowhich(i)globalcitizenship educationand(ii)educationforsustainable developmentaremainstreamedin (a)nationaleducationpolicies;(b)curricula; (c)teachereducation; and(d)studentassessment(SimilartoIndicat ors4.7.1and13.3.1)	Departmentof SchoolEducationandLite racy,MinistryofEducation	Annual		Mainstreamedallindicatorsexcludingreligiouseducation				

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
55	13.3.1:Extenttowhich(i)globalcitizenship educationand(ii)educationforsustainable developmentaremainstreamedin (a)nationaleducationpolicies;(b)curricula; (c)teachereducation; and(d)studentassessment(SimilartoIndicators4.7.1and12.8.1), 2020	Departmentof SchoolEducationandLiteracy,MinistryofEducation	Annual		Mainstreamedallindicatorsexcludingreligiouseducation				
56	5.b.1:PercentageofwomenemployedinITandITeSindustry	MinistryofElectronicsandInformationTechnology	Annual	MinistryofElectronicsandInformationTechnology	~37%	~38%	38%+	40-42%	
57	16.6.3:NumberofGovernmentservicesprovidedonlinetocitizens	MinistryofElectronicsandInformationTechnology	Annual		4127	4287	4447	4687	
58	12.4.1:WhetherthecountryhasratifiedinternationalMultilateralEnvironmentalAgreementsonhazardouswasteandotherchemicals	MinistryofEnvironment ForestandClimateChange	Annual	MinistryofEnvironmentForestandClimateChange	**Achievedin2018**				
59	13.2.1:Pre-2020action:Achievementofpre-2020goalsaspercountrypriority(percentagereductioninemissionintensityofGDP,over2005level)	MinistryofEnvironment ForestandClimateChange	2Years		**Achieved**				
60	15.7.1:Numberofcasesregisteredundertheewildlifeprotectionact,1972(similarto15.c.1)	MinistryofEnvironment ForestandClimateChange	Annual		MoEFCCinformedthatitwouldnotappropriatetofixmilestonefortheindicatorasthesamemayresultindecreaseinreportingthenumberof casesofwildlifecrime.				
61	15.9.1(a)ProgresstowardsnationaltargetsestablishedinaccordancewithAichiBiodiversityTarget2oftheStrategiesPlanforBiodiversity,2011-2020;(b)Integrationofbiodiversityintonationalaccountingandreportingsystems,defined asimplementationoftheSystemofEnvironmental-EconomicAccounting.	MoSPI	Annual		**15.9.1(b)isachieved.**				

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
62	15.c.1:NumberofcasesregisteredundertheWildlifeProtectionAct,1972(similarto15.7.1)	MinistryofEnvironmentForestandClimateChange	Annual		MoEFCCinformedthatitwouldnotappropriatetofixmilestonefortheindicatorasthesamemayresultindecreaseinreportingthenumberofcasesofwildlifecrime.				
63	10.7.1:Recruitmentcostbornebyemployeeasaproportionofmonthlyincomeearnedincountryofdestination	MinistryofExternalAffairs	Annual	MinistryofExternalAffairs	MEAhasindicatedthattherecruitmentcostisaonetimecostbornbytheemigrantworkerfortheentireworkcontractwhichisgenerally24 months.TheaverageincomeatUSD200ismonthlyincome.				
64	10.4.2:PercentageofbudgetallocatedtoNorthEasternStates	MinistryofFinance	Annual	MinistryofFinance	TheMinistryofFinanceinformedthatforbudgetrelatedindicators,milestonescannotbefixed.				
65	10.4.3:PercentageofbudgetallocatedforwelfareofSCsandSTs	MinistryofFinance	Annual						
66	12.c.1:AmountoffossilfuelsubsidyperunitofGDP	a)Numerator-MinistryofFinanceb)Denominator-NationalAccountsDivision,MoSPI	Annual						
67	16.6.1:Primarygovernmentexpendituresasaproportionoforiginalapproved budget	DEA,MinistryofFinance	Annual						
68	17.1.1:TotalgovernmentrevenueasaproportionofGDP,bysource	a)Numerator-MinistryofFinanceb)Denominator-NationalAccountsDivision,MoSPI	Annual						
69	17.1.2:Proportionofdomesticbudgetfundedbydomestictaxes	MinistryofFinance	Annual						
70	17.13.1:MacroeconomicDashboard	MinistryofFinance	Annual		Achieved				
71	17.19.1:BudgetallocatedtodifferentMinistriesforstrengtheningstatistics,(inRs.Lakh)	NationalAccountsDivision,NSO,MoSPI	Annual		Forbudgetrelatedindicators,milestonescannotbefixed.				

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
72	2.2.4:Percentageofpregnantwomenage15-49yearswhoareanaemic(<11.0g/dl)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare	44.4		38.4	33.9	
73	2.2.5:PercentageofChildrenage6-59monthswhoareanaemic(<11.0g/dl)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		51		43	37	
74	3.1.2:Percentageofbirths attendedbyskilledhealthpersonnel(Period5years)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		88		94	96	
75	3.1.3:Percentageofbirths attendedbyskilledhealthpersonnel(Period1year)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		88		94	97	
76	3.1.4:Percentageofwomenaged15-49yearswithalivebirth,forlastbirth,whoreceivedantenatalcare,fourtimesormore(Period5years/1year)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		58		70	75	
77	3.3.1:NumberofnewHIVinfectionsper1,000uninfectedpopulation	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalAIDS ControlOrganisation)	Annual		0.035	0.03	0.02	<0.01	
78	3.3.2:Tuberculosisincidenceper1,00,000population	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(RNTCPDivision)	Annual		164	142	112	65	
79	3.3.3:Malariaincidenceper1,000population	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NVBDCPDivision)	Annual		0.11	0.08	0	0	
80	3.3.5:Dengue:CaseFatalityRatio	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NVBDCPDivision)	Annual		<1	<1	<1	<1	

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
81	3.3.6:Proportionofgrade-2casesamongstnewcasesofLeprosy,(Per millionpopulation)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare	Annual		1.5	0.75	0.25	0	
82	3.3.7:Percentageofblocks reporting<1KalaAzarcaseper 10,000populationoutofthetotal endemicblocks	MinistryofHealth andFamilyWelfare (NVBDCPDivision)	Annual		Numberof blocks reporting<1 KalaAzar caseper 10,000 population-633	Numberof blocks reporting< 1KalaAzar caseper 10,000 population-633	Numberof blocks reporting< 1KalaAzar caseper 10,000 population-633	Number ofblocks reporting <1Kala Azarcase per 10,000 populatio n-633	
83	3.3.8:Percentageofdistricts reporting<1%Microfilariarate (MF)outofTargetedEndemic districts	MinistryofHealth andFamilyWelfare (NVBDCPDivision)	Annual		Numberof districts reporting< 1% Microfilaria rate(MF)-146	Numberof districts reporting< 1% Microfilaria rate(MF)-188	Numberof districts reporting< 1% Microfilaria rate(MF)-231	Number of districts reporting <1% Microfilari arate (MF)-272	
84	3.7.1:Percentageofcurrentlymarriedwomenaged15-49yearswhohavetheirneedforfamilyplanningsatisfiedwithmodernmethods	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(National FamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		77.5		79.1	80	
85	3.7.3:PercentageofInstitutionalBirths(5 years/1years)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(National FamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		85		89	92	
86	3.7.4:Percentageofcurrentlymarriedwomen(15-49years)whouseanymodernfamilyplanningmethods(similartoIndicator3.8.1and5.6.1)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(National FamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		52.4		54.3	55.3	
87	3.7.5:Percentageofwomenaged15-19yearswhowerealreadymothersorpregnant	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(National FamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		7		6.5	5.5	

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
88	3.8.1:Percentageofcurrentlymarriedwomen(15-49years)whouseanymodernfamilyplanningmethods(similartoIndicator3.7.4and5.6.1)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		52.4		54.3	55.3	
89	3.8.2:Proportionofpopulationwithlargehouseholdexpendituresonhealthasashareoftotalhouseholdexpenditureorincome	SDRD,MoSPI	5years		Settingofmilestonesisneitherfeasiblenordesirable				
90	3.8.3:PercentageofpeoplelivingwithHIVcurrentlyreceivingARTamongthedetectednumberofadultsandchildrenlivingwithHIV	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalAIDSControlOrganisation)	Annual		90	95	95	95	
91	3.8.4:Prevalenceofhypertensionamongmenandwomenage15-49years2015-16(inpercentage)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		Male:15.40; Female: 13.00	Male: 16.50; Female: 14.50	Male: 17.40; Female: 15.00	Male: 18.00; Female: 16.00	Targetsetisthemaximumlimit.
92	3.8.5:Percentageofpopulationinagegroup15-49whoreportedsoughttreatmentoutoftotalpopulationinthatagegrouphavingdiabetes	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		Male:76.00, Female:83.04	Male:81.25 ,Female:85.65	Male:86.50, Female:88.26	Male:90.00 , Female:90.00	
93	3.8.6:Percentageofwomenaged15-49whohaveeverundergoneCervixexaminations	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		32.84	48.65	64.46	75	
94	3.8.7:PercentageofTBcasessuccessfullytreated(curedplustreatmentcompleted)amongTBcasesnotifiedtothenationalhealthauthoritiesduringaspecifiedperiod	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(RNTCPDivision)	2Years		>90	>90	>90	>90	
95	3.8.8:Totalphysicians,nursesandmidwivesper10,000population,(similartoIndicator3.c.1)	PublichealthDivision,MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare	Annual		42.5	44	45	45.5	

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
96	3.9.2:ProportionofmenandwomenreportingAsthmaintheagegroup15-49years	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		Male:1.15,Female:1.85	Male:1.10,Female:1.80	Male:1.05,Female:1.75	Male:1.0,Female:1.7	
97	3.a.1:Percentageofadults15yearsandabovewithuseofanykindoftobacco(smokingandsmokeless)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(GlobalAdultTobaccoSurvey)	5Years			24%		20%	
98	3.b.1:Percentageofchildrenaged12-23monthsfullyimmunized(BCG,MeaslesandthreedosesofPentavalentvaccine)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		82		90	90	
99	3.b.2:BudgetaryallocationforDepartmentofHealthResearch,(inRs.crore)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare	Annual		3766	4704	5349.26	7119.87	
100	3.c.1:Totalphysicians,nursesandmidwivesper10,000population,inpercentage(similartoIndicator3.8.8)	PublichealthDivision,MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare	Annual		42.5	44	45	45.5	
101	3.c.2:Percentageofgovernmentspending(includingcurrentandcapitalexpenditure)inhealthsectortoGDP	NationalAccountsDivision,NSO,MoSPI	Annual		1.72	1.9	2.09	2.42	
102	5.6.1:Percentageofcurrentlymarriedwomen(15-49years)whousemodernmethodsoffamilyplanning(similartoIndicators3.7.4and3.8.1)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		52.4		54.3	55.3	
103	5.6.2:Unmetneedforfamilyplanningforcurrentlymarriedwomenaged15-49years,2015-16(inpercentage)	MinistryofHealthandFamilyWelfare(NationalFamilyHealthSurvey)	3Years		11.3		10.8	10.5	
104	11.3.1:ProportionofcitieswithMasterplans(similarto11.a.1)	MinistryofHousingandUrbanAffairs	Annual	MinistryofHousingandUrbanAffairs	60	75	90	100	

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
105	11.6.1:Percentageofwasteprocessed	MinistryofHousingandUrbanAffairs	Annual		85	95	100	100	
106	11.6.4:Percentageofwardswith100%doortodoorwastecollection	MinistryofHousingandUrbanAffairs	Annual		100	100	100	100	
107	11.a.1:ProportionofcitieswithMasterplans(similarto11.3.1)	MinistryofHousingandUrbanAffairs	Annual		60	75	90	100	
108	12.5.1:Numberofwasterecyclingplantsinstalled	MinistryofHousingandUrbanAffairs	Annual		Noseparatemilestonesarerequiredasthemilestoneshavebeensetfor SDGindicator11.6.1"Percentageofwasteprocessed'.				
109	12.5.2:NumberofUrbanLocalBodiesusingwastesegregationtechniques	MinistryofHousingandUrbanAffairs	Annual		ThedatasourceMinistryhasproposedrefinementintheindicator.Theindicatorwillberefinedfollowingdiscussionwithconcernedstakeholdersintherelevantforaandmilestoneswillbesetaccordingly.				
110	6.2.1:Proportionofhouseholdshavingaccesstotoiletfacility(Urban&Rural)	MinistryofJalShakti,DWSforRuralandMIS,NSS,MoSPIfor Urban	AnnualforRuraland 3yearsforUrban	MinistryofJalShakti	Achievedin2019-20.				
111	6.2.2:PercentageofDistrictsachievingOpenDefecationFree(ODF)target	DWS,MinistryofJalShakti	Annual		Achievedin2019-20.				
112	6.4.1:Percentagegroundwaterwithdrawalagainstavailability	CGWB,MinistryofJalShakti	Annual		DynamicGroundWaterResourcesarebeingassessedbyCGWBjointlywithStateGW/NodalDepartmentsperiodically(onceinthreeyears).				
113	6.6.1:Percentageofblocks/mandals/talukaover-exploited	CGWB,MinistryofJalShakti	Annual		DynamicGroundWaterResourcesarebeingassessedbyCGWBjointlywithStateGW/NodalDepartmentsperiodically(onceinthreeyears).				
114	8.b.1:Existenceofadevelopedandoperationalizednationalstrategyforyouthemployment,asadistinctstrategyoraspartofanationalemploymentstrategy	MinistryofLabourandEmployment	Annual	MinistryofLabourandEmployment	Achieved				
115	16.3.1:Numberofcourtsperlakhpopulation	MinistryofLawandJustice	Annual	MinistryofLawandJustice	MinistryofLawandJusticeinformedthatitisnotfeasibletosetthemilestonefortheindicator.				

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
116	16.3.3:NumberofJudges(alllevels)perlakhpopulation	MinistryofLawandJustice	Annual		MinistryofLawandJusticeinformedthatitisnotfeasibletosetthemilestonefortheindicator.				
117	8.3.3:OutstandingCredittoMSME	MinistryofMicro,SmallandMediumEnterprises	Annual	MinistryofMicro,SmallandMediumEnterprises	DataontheindicatorisbeingcollectedfromRBI.HenceRBImaysetthemilestone.RBIinformedthatitdoesn'tprescribeanytargettothebankswithregardstotheoutstandingcredittoMSMEsectors.				
118	8.3.4:NumberofMSMEunitsregisteredundertheonlineUdyogAadhaarregistration	MinistryofMicro,SmallandMediumEnterprises	Annual		ThedatasourceMinistryhasproposedrefinementintheindicator.Theindicatorwillberefinedfollowingdiscussionwithconcernedstakeholdersintherelevantforaandmilestoneswillbesetaccordingly.				
119	9.3.2:PercentageofcreditflowtoMSMEasapercentageofTotalAdjustedNetBankCredit	MinistryofMicro,SmallandMediumEnterprises	Annual		DataontheindicatorisbeingcollectedfromRBI.HenceRBImaysetthemilestone.RBIinformedthatitdoesn'tprescribeanytargettothebankswithregardstotheoutstandingcredittoMSMEsectors.				
120	7.1.1:Percentageofhouseholdselectrified	MinistryofPower	Annual	MinistryofPower	**Achievedin2021.**				
121	9.4.1:TotalCO_2emissionsofpowersectorperunitofGDP(inTonne/RupeesCrore)	MinistryofPower,CentralElectricityAuthority	Annual				1173MillionTonnes	1287 MillionTonnes	
122	1.3.3:Personsprovidedemploymentasapercentageofpersonswhodemanded employmentunderMahatmaGandhiNationalRuralEmploymentGuaranteeAct(MGNREGA)	DepartmentofRuralDevelopment,MinistryofRuralDevelopment	Annual	MinistryofRuralDevelopment	ThedatasourceMinistryhasproposedrefinementintheindicator.Theindicatorwillberefinedfollowingdiscussionwithconcernedstakeholdersintherelevantforaandmilestoneswillbesetaccordingly.				
123	1.3.4:NumberofSelfHelpGroups(SHGs)providedbankcreditlinkage	NationalBankforAgricultureandRuralDevelopment(NABARD)	Annual		TheexistingindicatorsneedrefinementandImplementingMinistryhasprovidedmilestonesforrefinedindicator.Theindicatorwillberefinedfollowingdiscussionwithconcernedstakeholdersintherelevantfora.				
124	5.a.5:ExclusivewomenSHGsinBanklinkedSHGs,(inpercentage)	NationalBankforAgricultureandRuralDevelopment(NABARD)	Annual						

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
125	8.8.3:Percentageofhouseholdsreceiving socialprotectionbenefitsunderMahatma GandhiNationalRuralEmploymentGuarantee Act(MGNREGA)	MinistryofRuralDevelopment	Annual		ThedatasourceMinistryhasproposeddeletionoftheindicator. Theindicatorwillbedeletedfollowingdiscussionwithconcerned stakeholdersintherelevantforaandmilestoneswillbesetaccordingly.				
126	9.5.2:Researchers(infulltimeequivalent) permillionpopulation	MinistryofScienceand Technology	Annual	MinistryofScienceandTechnology	MinistryofScienceandTechnologyinformeditisnotfeasibletosetthemilestonefortheindicatorasthesameiscompiledusingdivergentdatasources.				
127	1.3.6:Numberofseniorcitizensprovidedinstitutionalassistancethrough SeniorCitizenHomes/DayCareCentersfundedbytheGovernment	DepartmentofSocialJustice&Empowerment,MinistryofSocialJustice&Empowerment	Annual	MinistryofSocialJustice&Empowerment,DepartmentofSocialJustice&Empowerment	1336064	1658894	2021724	2640969	
128	3.5.2:Numberofpersonstreatedinde-addictioncentres(innumber)	DepartmentofSocialJustice&Empowerment,MinistryofSocialJustice&Empowerment	Annual		1230300	1573300	2012565	2855427	
129	8.9.1:DirectcontributionofTourismtototalGDPandingrowthrate	MinistryofTourism	Annual	MinistryofTourism	ThedatasourceMinistryhasinformedthatfixingmilestonesfortheindicatorisnotfeasibleasTourismIndustryhasbeenbadlyaffectedallovertheworlddueto COVID-19.				
130	8.9.2:Percentagechangeinnumberofvisitsbytourists(domestic&foreign)overpreviousyear	MinistryofTourism	Annual		MinistryofTourismhastargetedtoincreaseIndia'sshareofForeignTouristArrivalsinworld'sInternationalTouristArrivalsto1%by2020andincreaseto2%by2025.				
131	12.b.1:Implementationofstandardaccountingtoolstomonitortheeconomicandenvironmentalaspectsoftourismsustainability	MinistryofTourism	Annual		ThedatasourceMinistryhasinformedthatfixingmilestonesfortheindicatorisnotfeasibleasTourismIndustryhasbeenbadlyaffectedallovertheworlddueto COVID-19.				

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
132	16.a.1:Existenceofindependentnationalhumanrightsinstitutionsincompliancewiththe ParisPrinciples	NationalHumanRightsCommissionofIndia	Annual	NationalHumanRightsCommissionofIndia	Achieved				
133	15.3.1:Proportionoflandthatisdegraded overtotallandarea	NationalRemoteSensingCentre(NRSC),DepartmentofSpace	5Years	DepartmentofSpace	Thereisnoidentifiedprojecttomonitorlanddegradation statusinNRSC,atpresent.				
134	1.1.1:PovertyGapRatio	NITIAayog	5Years	NITIAayog	Thelatestestimationsforboththeindicatorsarebasedonthe2011-12ConsumerExpenditureSurveyconductedbyNationalStatisticalOffice(NSO).Dataonthelatestroundhasnotbeenreleasedtoenabletargetsetting.				
135	1.2.1:Proportionofpopulationlivingbelowthenationalpovertyline	NITIAayog	5Years						
136	5.4.1:Proportionoftimespentonunpaiddomesticandcarework	TUS,NSS,MoSPI	3Years	MoSPI	Itisnotfeasibletofixmilestonefortheindicator.				
137	17.18.2:WhetherthecountryhasnationalstatisticallegislationthatcomplieswiththeFundamentalPrinciplesofOfficialStatistics	MoSPI	Annual		Achieved				
138	16.9.2:Proportionofpopulationcoveredunder Aadhaar	UniqueIdentificationAuthorityofIndia	Annual	UniqueIdentificationAuthorityofIndia	92.63	93.61	94.65	96.28	

S.N.	NationalIndicator	DataSource	Periodicity	ImplementingMinistry	2023	2025	2027	2030	Remarks
139	9.1.2:Passengerandfreight volumes,bymodeoftransport	(1)RailwayBoardis datasourcefor passengermovement andfreightvolumes byRailways(2) ResearchWingof MinistryofRoad Transportand Highwayisdata sourceforpassenger movementand freightvolumesby Roads(3)Ministryof CivilAviationisdata sourceforpassenger movementand freightvolumesby air	Annual	(1)RailwayBoardisdata sourceforpassenger movementandfreight volumesbyRailways(2) ResearchWingofMinistry ofRoadTransportand Highwayisdatasourcefor passengermovementand freightvolumesbyRoads(3)MinistryofCivilAviationis datasourceforpassenger movementandfreight volumesbyair	Estimated passenger volumeby Road transport: 36819.36 Estimated Freight Volumeby Road transport (billion tonnes): 3835.05	Estimated passenger volumeby Road transport: 47014.63 Estimated Freight Volumeby Road transport (billion tonnes): 4573.16	Estimated passenger volumeby Road transport: 60032.99 Estimated Freight Volumeby Road transport (billion tonnes): 5453.33	Estimated passenge rvolume byRoad transport: 86621.42 Estimated Freight Volume byRoad transport (billion tonnes): 7101.17	
140	1.4.1:Proportionofpopulationlivinginhous eholdswithaccesstobasicservices	M/oJalShakti,M/oPowe r,M/oHealthandFamily Welfare,M/oEducation, M/oPetroleumandNatu ralGas	Annual	M/oJalShakti,M/oPower,M/oHeal thandFamilyWelfare,M/oEducatio n,M/oPetroleumandNaturalGas	Theindicatoriscombinationof6differentnationalindicatorsand milestoneforsuchindicatorswillbesetunderrespectiveSDGs.				
141	7.3.1:Energyintensitymeasuredintermsofp rimaryenergyandGDP,(inmegajoulesperru pee)	MinistryofCoal,Ministryof PetroleumandNaturalGa sandCentralElectricityAu thority	Annual	MinistryofCoal,MinistryofPetrole umandNaturalGasandCentralEl ectricityAuthority	It isnotfeasibletosetthemilestonefortheindicatorasthesameis compiledusingdivergentdatasources.				
142	15.6.1:Whethercountryhasadoptedlegisl ative,administrativeandpolicyframework stoensurefairandequitablesharingofben efits	MinistryofEnvironment ForestandClimateChan geandMinistryofAgricult ureandFarmersWelfare	Annual	MinistryofEnvironmentForestan dClimateChangeandMinistryof AgricultureandFarmersWelfare	**Achievedin2021.**				

Fortheremainingindicators,thelineMinistries/Departmentshaveinformedthattheyarestillworkingwiththeirconcernedi Divisions/Wings/UnitsorwithotherrelatedMinistries(whereverapplicable).MoSPIwillcontinuetoin teractwiththelineMinistries/Departmentsforfacilitatingmilestonesfixingonremainingindicators.

Annexure III

State-wise Maternal Mortality Ratio (MMR)

Sl. No	India/States	2016-18
1	Andhra Pradesh	65
2	Assam	215
3	Bihar	149
4	Jharkhand	71
5	Gujarat	75
6	Haryana	91
7	**India**	**113**
8	Karnataka	92
9	Kerala	43
10	Madhya Pradesh	173
11	Chhattisgarh	159
12	Maharashtra	46
13	Odisha	150
16	Punjab	129
14	Rajasthan	164
15	Tamil Nadu	60
16	Telangana	63
17	Uttarakhand	99
18	Uttar Pradesh	197
19	West Bengal	98
20	Other States	85

AnnexureIV

Under 5 Mortality Rate (U5MR) as per SRS 2018

S. No.	States	U5MR
	India	**36**
1	Andhra Pradesh	33
2	Assam	47
3	Bihar	37
4	Chhattisgarh	45
5	Delhi	19
6	Gujarat	31
7	Haryana	36
8	Himachal Pradesh	23
9	Jammu & Kashmir	23
10	Jharkhand	34
11	Karnataka	28
12	Kerala	10
13	Madhya Pradesh	56
14	Maharashtra	22
15	Orissa	44
16	Punjab	23
17	Rajasthan	40
18	Tamil Nadu	17
19	Telangana	30
20	Uttar Pradesh	47
21	Uttarakhand	33
22	West Bengal	26

Annexure V

Status of Neonatal Mortality Rate (NMR) in India/ States/ UTs (2018)

India	**23**
Andhra Pradesh	21
Assam	21
Bihar	25
Chhattisgarh	29
Delhi	10
Gujarat	19
Himachal Pradesh	13
Jammu & Kashmir	17
Jharkhand	21
Karnataka	16
Kerala	5
Madhya Pradesh	35
Maharashtra	13
Orissa	31
Punjab	13
Rajasthan	26
Tamil Nadu	10
Telangana	19
Uttar Pradesh	32
Uttarakhand	22
West Bengal	16

Annexure-VI

Details of 44 Indicators under SDG-3 assigned to MOHFW

SDG Targets	Indicators under NIF	India (Latest data available)
(Goal 1) 1.3 : Implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, including floors, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable	(1) (1.3.1) Percentage of Households with any usual member covered by a health scheme or health insurance (%), NFHS-4	28.7
(Goal 2) 2.1 : By 2030, end hunger and ensure access by all people, in particular the poor and people in vulnerable situations, including infants, to safe, nutritious and sufficient food all year round	(2) (2.1.1) Percentage of Children who are underweight (Weight-for-Age(below - 2SD) %, NFHS-4	35.7
(Goal 2) 2.2 : By 2030, end all forms of malnutrition, including achieving, by 2025, the internationally agreed targets on stunting and wasting in children under 5 years of age, and address the nutritional needs of adolescent girls, pregnant and lactating women and older persons	(3) (2.2.1) Percentage of Children who are stunted (Height-for-Age), NFHS-4	38.4
	(4) (2.2.2) Percentage of children who are wasted (Weight-for-Height (below - 2SD) %, NFHS-4	21.0
	(5) (2.2.3) Percentage of women(age 15-49) whose body mass index (BMI) is below normal (<18.5 kg/m2), NFHS-4, 2015-16	22.9
	(6) (2.2.4) Percentage of pregnant women age 15-49 years who are anaemic (<11.0 g/dl) NFHS-4, 2015-16	50.4
	(7) (2.2.5) Percentage of children age 6-59 months who are anaemic (<11.0 g/d), NFHS-4, 2015-16	58.5
(Goal 3) 3.1 : By 2030, reduce the global maternal mortality ratio to less than 70 per 100,000 live births	(8) (3.1.2) Percentage of births attended by skilled health personnel (5 years preceding the survey), NFHS-4	81.4
	(9) (3.1.3) Percentage of births attended by skilled health personnel (last one year)	84.4

SDG Targets	Indicators under NIF	India (Latest data available)
	NFHS-4, 2015-16	
	(10) (3.1.4) Percentage of women aged 15-49 years with a live birth, for last birth, who received antenatal care, four times or more (5 years), NFHS-4, 2015-16	51.2
(Goal 3) 3.2 : By 2030, end preventable deaths of newborns and children under 5 years of age, with all countries aiming to reduce neonatal mortality to at least as low as 12 per 1,000 live births and under-5 mortality to at least as low as 25 per 1,000 live births	(11) (3.2.3) Percentage of children aged 12-23 months fully immunized (BCG, Measles and three doses of Pentavalent vaccine), NFHS-4, 2015-16	62.0
(Goal 3) 3.3 : By 2030, end the epidemics of AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria and neglected tropical diseases and combat hepatitis, water- borne diseases and other communicable diseases	(12) (3.3.1) Number of new HIV infections per 1,000 uninfected population (Incidence Rate) (NACO)	0.05 in 2019-20
	(13) (3.3.2) Tuberculosis incidence per 100,000 population (NTEP)	2019 = 193
	(14) (3.3.3) Malaria incidence per 1,000 population (NVBDCP)	2020 = 0.13
	(15) (3.3.4) Prevalence of Hepatitis 'B' per 1 Lakh population (NFHS-4)	0.95%
	(16) (3.3.5) Dengue: Case Fatality Ratio (CFR) (NVBDCP)	2020 = 0.06
	(17) (3.3.6) Number of Chikungunia cases (NVBDCP)	The indicator is dropped.
	(18) (3.3.7) Percentage of blocks reporting <1 Kala Azar case per 10,000 population out of the total endemic blocks (NVBDCP)	2020=97.47
	(19) (3.3.8) Percentage of district reporting <1% microfilaria rate (MF) out of	2020=36.03

SDG Targets	Indicators under NIF	India (Latest data available)
	the Targeted Endemic districts (NVBDCP)	
	(20) (3.3.6) The proportion of grade-2 cases amongst new cases of Leprosy detected (NLEP) per 10 lakh population	1.96 in 2019-20
	(21) (3.3.1) : HIV Adult Prevalence Rate (NACO)	The indicator is dropped.
(Goal 3) 3.4 : By 2030, reduce by one third premature mortality from non-communicable diseases through prevention and treatment and promote mental health and well-being	(22) (3.4.1): Number of deaths due to cancer	Under review
(Goal 3) 3.5 : Strengthen the prevention and treatment of substance abuse, including narcotic drug abuse and harmful use of alcohol	(23) (3.5.1) Percentage of Women age 15-49 who drink alcohol about once a week out of total (figures given against indicator 3.5.3) who drink alcohol (NFHS-4), 2015-16	35.0
	(23) (3.5.1) Percentage of men age 15-49 who drink alcohol about once a week out of total (figures given against indicator 3.5.3) who drink alcohol (NFHS-4) 2015-16	Men 15-49 = 40.7
	(24) (3.5.3): Percentage of men (15-54) who drink alcohol, NFHS-4) 2015-16	29.5
	(24) (3.5.3) Indicator: Percentage of women (15-49) who drink alcohol, (NFHS-4) 2015-16	1.2
(Goal 3) 3.7 : By 2030, ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health-care services, including for family planning, information and education, and the integration of reproductive health into national strategies and programmes	(25) (3.7.1) Percentage of currently married women (15-49) who have their need for family planning satisfied with modern methods, (NFHS-4), 2015-16	71.9
	(26) (3.7.5) Percentage of women aged 15-19 years who were already mothers or pregnant, (NFHS-4), 2015-16	7.9

SDG Targets	Indicators under NIF	India (Latest data available)
	(27) (3.7.3) Percentage of institutional births (5 years), (NFHS-4), 2015-16	78.9
(Goal 3) 3.8 : Achieve universal health coverage, including financial risk protection, access to quality essential health-care services and access to safe, effective, quality and affordable essential medicines and vaccines for all	(28) (3.8.1) Percentage of currently married women (15-49 years) who use any modern family planning methods, (NFHS-4), 2015-16	47.7
	(29) (3.8.7) Percentage of TB cases successfully treated (cured plus treatment completed) among TB cases notified to the national health authorities during a specified period (NTEP, 2019)	81
	(30) (3.8.3) Percentage of people living with HIV currently receiving ART among the detected number of adults and children living with HIV (NACO, 2019-20)	84%
	(31) (3.8.4) Prevalence of hypertension- Women (15-49), (NFHS-4), 2015-16	11.0
	(31) (3.8.4) - Prevalence of hypertension - MEN (15-49 years), (NFHS-4), 2015-16	14.8
	(32) (3.8.5) Percentage of population in age group 15-49 who reported sought treatment out of total population in that age group having diabetes (NFHS-4), 2015-16	Male= 72.50 Female = 81.30
	(33) (3.8.6) Percentage of women aged 15-49 who have ever undergone Cervix Examinations (NFHS-4), 2015-16	22.3
	(34) (3.8.7) Prevalence of current tobacco uses among men and women aged 15-49 years	The indicator is removed
	(35) (3.8.8) Total Physician, nurses and midwives per 10000 population (Medical	31.30

SDG Targets	Indicators under NIF	India (Latest data available)
	Education, 2020)	
(Goal 3)3.9 : By 2030, substantially reduce the number of deaths and illnesses from hazardous chemicals and air, water and soil pollution and contamination	(36) (3.9.2) Percentage of women (15-49) reporting Asthma, (NFHS-4), 2015-16	1.9
	(36) (3.9.2) Percentage of men (15-49) reporting Asthma, (NFHS-4), 2015-16	1.2
(Goal 3) 3.a : Strengthen the implementation of the World Health Organization Framework Convention on Tobacco Control in all countries, as appropriate	(37) (3.a.1): Percentage of adults 15 years and above with use of any kind of tobacco (smoking and smokeless), 2016-17 (GATS)	28.6
(Goal 3) 3.b : Support the research and development of vaccines and medicines for the communicable and non-communicable diseases that primarily affect developing countries, provide access to affordable essential medicines and vaccines, in accordance with the Doha Declaration on the TRIPS Agreement and Public Health, which affirms the right of developing countries to use to the full the provisions in the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights regarding flexibilities to protect public health, and, in particular, provide access to medicines for all	(38) (3.b.2): Budgetary allocation for Department of Health Research (DHR), 2020-21 (Rs. In crore)	2100 Crores
(Goal 3) 3.c : Substantially increase health financing and the recruitment, development, training and retention of the health workforce in developing countries, especially in least developed countries and small island developing States	(39) (3.c.1) Total Physician, nurses and midwives per 10000 population (Medical Education, 2020)	31.30
(Goal 5) 5.2 : Eliminate all forms of violence against all women and girls in the public and private spheres, including trafficking and	(40) (5.2.6) : Percentage of ever married women age 15-49 years who have ever experienced physical or	30.9

SDG Targets	Indicators under NIF	India (Latest data available)
sexual and other types of exploitation	sexual violence committed by their husband, (NFHS-4), 2015-16	
(Goal 5)5.3 : Eliminate all harmful practices, such as child, early and forced marriage and female genital mutilation	(41) (5.3.1): Percentage of women aged 20-24 years who were married by exact age 18 years, (NFHS-4), 2015-16	26.8
(Goal 5) 5.6 : Ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health and reproductive rights as agreed in accordance with the Programme of Action of the International Conference on Population and Development and the Beijing Platform for Action and the outcome documents of their review conferences	(42) (5.6.1) Percentage of currently married women (15-49 years) who use modern methods of family planning, 2015-16 (similar to 3.7.4 and 3.8.1) (NFHS-4), 2015-16	47.7
	(43) (5.6.2) : Unmet need for family planning for currently married women aged 15-49 years, 2015-16 (in percentage) (NFHS-4), 2015-16	12.9
	(44) (5.6.3)) Proportion of population aged 15-24 years with correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS (NFHS-4), 2015-16	Male= 31.50 Female = 21.70

CHAPTER III

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES RECEIVED FROM THE GOVERNMENT

-Nil-

CHAPTER IV

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION

-Nil-

CHAPTER V

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH THE GOVERNMENT HAVE FURNISHED INTERIM REPLIES

-Nil-

NEW DELHI;
07 December, 2022
16 Agrahayana, 1944 (*Saka*)

ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY
Chairperson,
Public Accounts Committee

APPENDIX-II

(Vide Paragraph 5 of Introduction)

ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE CONTAINED IN THEIR THRITY-SECOND REPORT (SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)

(i)	Total number of Observations/Recommendations	20
(ii)	Observations/Recommendations of the Committee which have been accepted by the Government: Para Nos. – 1-20	Total : 20 Percentage: 100%
(iii)	Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the reply of the Government: Para Nos. – NIL	Total : 00 Percentage: 00
(iv)	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration: Para Nos. - NIL	Total : 00 Percentage: 00
(v)	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies: Para Nos. – NIL	Total : 00 Percentage: 00